GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

# STATE OF MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS MICHIGAN OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS AND RULES

ORLENE HAWKS DIRECTOR



Date Mailed: November 19, 2019 MOAHR Docket No.: 19-011201

Agency No.:
Petitioner:

**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE: Landis Lain** 

## **HEARING DECISION**

Following Petitioner's request for a hearing, this matter is before the undersigned Administrative Law Judge pursuant to MCL 400.9 and 400.37; 7 CFR 273.15 to 273.18; 42 CFR 431.200 to 431.250; 42 CFR 438.400 to 438.424; 45 CFR 99.1 to 99.33; and 45 CFR 205.10; and Mich Admin Code, R 792.11002. After due notice, a telephone hearing was held on November 14, 2019, from Lansing, Michigan. The Petitioner, was represented by himself. The Department of Health and Human Services (Department or Respondent) was represented by Renee Trudeau, Hearings Facilitator.

Respondent's Exhibit A pages 1-14 were admitted as evidence.

#### **ISSUE**

Did the Department properly cancel Petitioner's Food Assistance Program (FAP) case?

### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

The Administrative Law Judge, based on the competent, material, and substantial evidence on the whole record, finds as material fact:

- 1. Petitioner was a FAP benefit recipient.
- 2. On August 23, 2019 the Department received a notice that Petitioner was employed.
- 3. On September 6, 2019 Petitioner provided a new hire form to the Department with one pay stub.
- 4. Petitioner provided a form indicating that he was working 30+ hours per week.

- 5. The June paystub provided by Petitioner indicated that Petitioner worked 38+ hours per week.
- 6. On September 11, 2019 the caseworker sent a check list along with the DHS-38 employment form to gain more current information to ensure ongoing benefits were accurate. The information was due to the Department by September 23, 2019.
- 7. On September 26, 2019 it was noted that the Petitioner had not returned the new information.
- 8. Food Assistance Program benefits were placed into closer for failure to provide verification information in a timely manner.
- 9. On September 26, 2019 the Department sent Petitioner a Notice of Case Action indicating that Petitioner's food assistance program benefits would be closed for failure to provide verification information.
- 10. On October 7, 2019 the Department received a Request for Hearing to contest the Department's negative action.
- 11. On the state of the Michigan Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules received a hearing summary and attached documents.

# CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The regulations governing the hearing and appeal process for applicants and recipients of public assistance in Michigan are found in the Michigan Administrative Code, MAC R 400.901-400.951. An opportunity for a hearing shall be granted to an applicant who requests a hearing because his or her claim for assistance has been denied. MAC R 400.903(1). Clients have the right to contest a Department decision affecting eligibility or benefit levels whenever it is believed that the decision is incorrect. The Department will provide an administrative hearing to review the decision and determine the appropriateness of that decision. BAM 600.

Department policies are contained in the Department of Health and Human Services Bridges Administrative Manual (BAM), Department of Health and Human Services Bridges Eligibility Manual (BEM), Department of Health and Human Services Reference Tables Manual (RFT), and Department of Health and Human Services Emergency Relief Manual (ERM).

The Food Assistance Program (FAP) [formerly known as the Food Stamp program] is established by the Food and Nutrition Act of 2008, as amended, 7 USC 2011 to 2036a and is implemented by the federal regulations contained in 7 CFR 273. The Department (formerly known as the Department of Human Services) administers FAP pursuant to MCL 400.10, the Social Welfare Act, MCL 400.1-.119b, and Mich Admin Code, R 400.3001-.3011.

## Pertinent FAP policy indicates:

## Pertinent Department policy dictates:

Clients have the right to contest a Department decision affecting eligibility or benefit levels whenever it is believed that the decision is incorrect. The Department will provide an administrative hearing to review the decision and determine the appropriateness. The Michigan Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules (MOAHR) may grant a hearing for any of the following:

- Denial of an application and/or supplemental payments.
- Reduction in the amount of program benefits or service.
- Suspension or termination of program benefits or service.
- Restrictions under which benefits, or services are provided.
- Delay of any action beyond standards of promptness.
- For FAP only, the current level of benefits or denial of expedited service.
   Department of Human Services Bridges Administrative Manual (BAM) 600 (April 1, 2017), pp 3-4.

The Petitioner or AHR has 90 calendar days from the date of the written notice of case action to request a hearing. The request must be received in the local office within the 90 days. BAM 600, page 6

The Department must establish its case by a preponderance of the evidence on the record. A preponderance of evidence is evidence which is of a greater weight or more convincing than evidence offered in opposition to it. It is simply that evidence which outweighs the evidence offered to oppose it *Martucci v Detroit Commissioner of Police*, 322 Mich 270; 33 NW2d 789 (1948).

The Department must establish its case by a preponderance of the evidence on the record. A preponderance of evidence is evidence which is of a greater weight or more convincing than evidence offered in opposition to it. It is simply that evidence which outweighs the evidence offered to oppose it *Martucci v Detroit Commissioner of Police*, 322 Mich 270; 33 NW2d 789 (1948).

All Programs Verification means documentation or other evidence to establish the accuracy of the client's verbal or written statements.

#### Obtain verification when:

 Required by policy. Bridges Eligibility Manual (BEM) items specify which factors and under what circumstances verification is required.

- Required as a local office option. The requirement must be applied the same for every client. Local requirements may not be imposed for Medicaid Assistance (MA).
- Information regarding an eligibility factor is unclear, inconsistent, incomplete or contradictory. The questionable information might be from the client or a third party.

Verification is usually required at application/redetermination and for a reported change affecting eligibility or benefit level. (Bridges Administrative Manual (BAM) 130, page 1)

In this case, Petitioner did not return requested verification information in a timely manner.

The Administrative Law Judge, based on the above Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, and for the reasons stated on the record, if any, finds that the Department has established by the necessary competent material, and substantial evidence on the record, that it was acting in accordance with Department policy when it cancelled Petitioner's FAP benefits because Petitioner failed to provide income verification information. Petitioner has not established good cause for failure to return the information to the Department. The Department's case is established by a preponderance of the evidence presented and must be upheld.

# **DECISION AND ORDER**

Accordingly, the Department's decision is **AFFIRMED**.

LL/nr

Administrative Law Judge for Robert Gordon, Director

Department of Health and Human Services

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**: A party may appeal this Order in circuit court within 30 days of the receipt date. A copy of the circuit court appeal must be filed with the Michigan Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules (MOAHR).

A party may request a rehearing or reconsideration of this Order if the request is received by MOAHR within 30 days of the date the Order was issued. The party requesting a rehearing or reconsideration must provide the specific reasons for the request. MOAHR will not review any response to a request for rehearing/reconsideration.

A written request may be mailed or faxed to MOAHR. If submitted by fax, the written request must be faxed to (517) 763-0155; Attention: MOAHR Rehearing/Reconsideration Request.

If submitted by mail, the written request must be addressed as follows:

Michigan Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules Reconsideration/Rehearing Request P.O. Box 30639 Lansing, Michigan 48909-8139

**DHHS** 

Renee Trudeau 1401 Carpenter Ave. Iron Mountain, MI 49801

Dickinson County DHHS- via electronic mail

BSC1- via electronic mail

M. Holden- via electronic mail

D. Sweeney- via electronic mail

Petitioner

