

**STATE OF MICHIGAN
MICHIGAN ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING SYSTEM
ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS FOR THE
DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES**

IN THE MATTER OF:

[REDACTED]

Reg. No.: 201360568
Issue No(s): [REDACTED]
Case No.: [REDACTED]
Hearing Date: December 5, 2013
County: Tuscola

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE: Gary F. Heisler

HEARING DECISION

Following Claimant's request for a hearing, this matter is before the undersigned Administrative Law Judge pursuant to MCL 400.9 and 400.37; 42 CFR 431.200 to 431.250; and 45 CFR 205.10. After due notice, a telephone hearing was held on December 5, 2013, from Lansing, Michigan. Participants on behalf of Claimant included himself. Claimant testified that his designated authorized representative from Tuscola Behavioral Health Systems was no longer involved and would not be participating. Participants on behalf of the Department of Human Services (Department) included ES

[REDACTED].

ISSUES

Did the Department of Human Services properly determine that Claimant is not disabled and deny Claimant's September 19, 2012 application for Medical Assistance (MA) based on disability and State Disability Assistance (SDA)?

FINDINGS OF FACT

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the competent, material and substantial evidence on the whole record, finds as material fact:

1. Claimant is a 54 year old male, born on [REDACTED]. Claimant is 5 feet 8 inches tall and weighs approximately 185 pounds. Claimant's formal education consists of a high school diploma and some college classes.
2. Claimant has past relevant work experience as follows: in construction as an electrical contractor; as a self-employed pet store owner; in manufacturing doing furniture assembly; and in sales as a wholesale furniture representative.

3. Claimant asserts disability based on sleep apnea; depression; degenerative disc problems; previous injuries to feet, knees and elbows; and COPD.
4. Claimant reports he last worked in October 2011 as a furniture salesman.
5. On September 19, 2012, Claimant applied for Medical Assistance (MA) based on disability, retroactive Medical Assistance (MA) based on disability and State Disability Assistance (SDA).
6. On July 2, 2013, the Department of Human Services Medical Review Team determined that Claimant was not disabled in accordance with the standards for Medical Assistance (MA) or State Disability Assistance (SDA).
7. On July 5, 2013, Claimant was sent notice of the Department's determination.
8. On July 22, 2013, Claimant submitted a request for hearing.
9. On September 23, 2013, the State Hearing Review Team determined that Claimant was not disabled in accordance with the standards for Medical Assistance (MA) or State Disability Assistance (SDA).

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Medical Assistance (MA) program is established by Title XIX of the Social Security Act and is implemented by Title 42 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR). The Department of Human Services (DHS or department) administers the MA program pursuant to MCL 400.10, *et seq.*, and MCL 400.105. Department policies are found in the Program Administrative Manual (PAM), the Program Eligibility Manual (PEM) and the Program Reference Manual (PRM).

The State Disability Assistance (SDA) program which provides financial assistance for disabled persons is established by 2004 PA 344. The Department of Human Services (DHS or department) administers the SDA program pursuant to MCL 400.10, *et seq.*, and MAC R 400.3151-400.3180. Department policies are found in the Program Administrative Manual (PAM), the Program Eligibility Manual (PEM) and the Program Reference Manual (PRM).

Disability determinations done by the State of Michigan for Medical Assistance (MA) based on disability use the Social Security Administration standards found in United States Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) at Title 20, Part 416. The law defines disability as the inability to do any substantial gainful activity by reason of any medically determinable physical or mental impairment which can be expected to result in death or which has lasted or can be expected to last for a continuous period of at least 12 months. To meet this definition, you must have severe impairments that make you unable to do your past relevant work or any other substantial gainful work that exists in the national economy.

Disability determinations done by the State of Michigan, for State Disability Assistance (SDA), use the same standards with one minor difference. For State Disability Assistance (SDA) the medically determinable physical or mental impairments that prevent substantial gainful activity must result in death or last at least 90 days.

In accordance with the Federal Regulations an initial disability determination is a sequential evaluation process. The evaluation consists of five steps that are followed in a set order.

STEP 1

At this step a determination is made on whether Claimant is engaging in substantial gainful activity (20 CFR 416.920(b)). If you are performing activities for pay or profit, we will use 20 CFR 416.971 through 416.975 to evaluate the activities to determine if they are substantial gainful activity. Substantial gainful activity is defined as work activity: that is both substantial and gainful; and involves doing significant physical or mental activities. Gainful work activity is work activity that you do for pay or profit (20 CFR 416.972). If you are engaged in substantial gainful activity, you are not disabled regardless of how severe your physical or mental impairments are and regardless of your age, education, and work experience.

In the present case, Claimant denied having any employment since the date of the MA application; no evidence was submitted to contradict Claimant's testimony. Without ongoing employment, it can only be concluded that Claimant is not performing SGA. It is found that Claimant is not performing SGA; accordingly, the disability analysis may proceed to step two.

STEP 2

At the second step it is determined whether you have a severe physical or mental impairment that meets the duration requirement or a combination of impairments that is severe and meets the duration requirement (20CFR 416.920). An impairment or combination of impairments is severe within the meaning of the regulations if it significantly limits an individual's ability to perform basic work activities. When we talk about basic work activities, we mean the abilities and aptitudes necessary to do most jobs. Examples of these include:

- (1) Physical functions such as walking, standing, sitting, lifting, pushing, pulling, reaching, carrying or handling;
- (2) Capacities for seeing, hearing, and speaking;
- (3) Understanding, carrying out, and remembering simple instructions;
- (4) Use of judgment;

- (5) Responding appropriately to supervision, co-workers and usual work situations; and
- (6) Dealing with changes in a routine work setting.

An impairment or combination of impairments is not severe if it does not significantly limit your physical or mental ability to do basic work activities (20 CFR 416.921).

In addition to the limiting effect of the impairments they must also meet durational requirements, 90 days for State Disability Assistance (SDA) and 12 months for Medical Assistance (MA) based on disability. If we determine that your impairments are not severe, you are not disabled.

Claimant asserts disability based upon: sleep apnea; depression; degenerative disc problems; previous injuries to feet, knees and elbows; and COPD. What follows is a synopsis of all recent, relevant evidence in the record from medical sources presented in chronological order.

There is a hospital report from July 10, 2012. Claimant was seen for a complaint of long term coughing and occasional difficulty breathing. Claimant reported exposure to mold and asbestos, a history of significant tobacco abuse, and daily smoking of medical marijuana. Claimant also reported usually coughing in the morning for approximately 45 minutes and brings up a white phlegm-like production. ██████ examined Claimant and found his breath sounds were clear and equal bilaterally with no rales, ronchi or wheezes. The Doctor's psychological observation of Claimant was that he was alert, oriented and had appropriate behavior and judgment. A chest Xray was taken and showed clear lungs and no acute abnormalities. Claimant's diagnosis was "cough, probably secondary to COPD". Advair was prescribed. (Pages 48-51)

There is a Radiology Report from Dr. Warnars dated July 31, 2012. The Doctor found mild to moderate degenerative disc disease from C4-C7, T5-T10, L1-L2 and L4-L5. Severe degenerative disc disease was noted at L5-S1. The Doctor also noted: a 3mm retrolisthesis of C6 on C5; some left rotational misalignment of the cervical spine; a previous coccyx fracture; and mild to moderate osteo-arthritis. (Pages 142 & 143)

There is an Initial Psychiatric Evaluation by ██████ dated September 18, 2012. The Doctor found Claimant had no history of psychiatric hospitalization but did have a significant history of polysubstance dependence. Claimant's affect was restricted at times but his responses were appropriate and he was very talkative at times. Claimant denied any hallucinations, suicidal thoughts or homicidal thoughts. Claimant showed no abnormal involuntary movements. Claimant was diagnosed with recurrent major depression, rule out PTSD, polysubstance dependence with current use of marijuana and rule out antisocial personality traits. (Pages 16 & 17).

There is also a Psychiatric/Psychological Examination Report and a Mental Residual Functional Capacity Assessment from [REDACTED] based on a December 7, 1012 examination. The Doctor found Claimant's appearance appropriate with a depressed mood and bland affect. The Doctor also found Claimant to be readily tearful with a pessimistic outlook and inability to consider solution focused themes. Claimant was diagnosed with recurrent major depression and rule out antisocial personality traits. (Pages 14 & 15) The Mental Residual Functional Capacity Assessment indicated Claimant was: not significantly limited in 4 of 20 categories evaluated; moderately limited in 10 of 20 categories evaluated; and markedly limited in 6 of 20 categories evaluated. (Pages 20 & 21)

There is a physical examination report from May 1, 2013 done by [REDACTED]. (Pages 210 to 217) The Range of Motion Study conducted during the examination showed normal range of motion except for a slight reduction in the lumbar spine and supination of both elbows. Claimant's lumbar and cervical spine were tender with muscle spasm but the straight leg raise was negative bilaterally.

Claimant does have severe physical and/or mental impairments that meets the duration requirement.

STEP 3

At the third step, it is determined whether your impairments meet or equal the criteria of an impairment listed in a Social Security Administration impairment listing 20 CFR Part 404, Subpart P, Appendix 1. If your impairment meets or equals the criteria of a listing and meets the duration requirement, you are disabled.

An attempt was made to compare the medical evidence from Claimant's July 10, 2012 hospital visit (Pages 48-51) to CFR 20 Appendix 1 to Subpart P of Part 404 – Listing of Impairments section 3.01 Category of Impairments, Respiratory System. There is insufficient medical information to make any comparison.

The July 31, 2012 Radiology Report from Dr. Warnars (Pages 142 & 143) and the physical examination report from May 1, 2013 done by [REDACTED] (Pages 210 to 217) were compared to CFR 20 Appendix 1 to Subpart P of Part 404 – Listing of Impairments section 1.04 Disorders of the spine listed below.

1.04 Disorders of the spine (e.g., herniated nucleus pulposus, spinal arachnoiditis, spinal stenosis, osteoarthritis, degenerative disc disease, facet arthritis, vertebral fracture), resulting in compromise of a nerve root (including the cauda equina) or the spinal cord. With:

A. Evidence of nerve root compression characterized by neuro-anatomic distribution of pain, limitation of motion of the spine, motor loss (atrophy with associated muscle weakness or muscle weakness) accompanied by sensory or

reflex loss and, if there is involvement of the lower back, positive straight-leg raising test (sitting and supine);

or

B. Spinal arachnoiditis, confirmed by an operative note or pathology report of tissue biopsy, or by appropriate medically acceptable imaging, manifested by severe burning or painful dysesthesia, resulting in the need for changes in position or posture more than once every 2 hours;

or

C. Lumbar spinal stenosis resulting in pseudoclaudication, established by findings on appropriate medically acceptable imaging, manifested by chronic nonradicular pain and weakness, and resulting in inability to ambulate effectively, as defined in 1.00B2b.

The objective medical evidence of record does not establish that claimant meets this listing.

The medical evidence from Dr. Movva (Pages 14 to 21) was compared to CFR 20 Appendix 1 to Subpart P of Part 404 – Listing of Impairments section 12.04 Affective Disorders listed below.

12.04 Affective Disorders: Characterized by a disturbance of mood, accompanied by a full or partial manic or depressive syndrome. Mood refers to a prolonged emotion that colors the whole psychic life; it generally involves either depression or elation.

The required level of severity for these disorders is met when the requirements in both A and B are satisfied, or when the requirements in C are satisfied.

A. Medically documented persistence, either continuous or intermittent, of one of the following:

1. Depressive syndrome characterized by at least four of the following:

- a. Anhedonia or pervasive loss of interest in almost all activities; or
- b. Appetite disturbance with change in weight; or
- c. Sleep disturbance; or
- d. Psychomotor agitation or retardation; or
- e. Decreased energy; or
- f. Feelings of guilt or worthlessness; or
- g. Difficulty concentrating or thinking; or

h. Thoughts of suicide; or

i. Hallucinations, delusions, or paranoid thinking; or

AND

B. Resulting in at least two of the following:

1. Marked restriction of activities of daily living; or

2. Marked difficulties in maintaining social functioning; or

3. Marked difficulties in maintaining concentration, persistence, or pace; or

4. Repeated episodes of decompensation, each of extended duration;

OR

C. Medically documented history of a chronic affective disorder of at least 2 years' duration that has caused more than a minimal limitation of ability to do basic work activities, with symptoms or signs currently attenuated by medication or psychosocial support, and one of the following:

1. Repeated episodes of decompensation, each of extended duration; or

2. A residual disease process that has resulted in such marginal adjustment that even a minimal increase in mental demands or change in the environment would be predicted to cause the individual to decompensate; or

3. Current history of 1 or more years' inability to function outside a highly supportive living arrangement, with an indication of continued need for such an arrangement.

The objective medical evidence of record does not establish that claimant meets this listing.

The objective medical evidence of record does not show Claimant is disabled based on any of the CFR 20 Appendix 1 to Subpart P of Part 404 – Listing of Impairments.

STEP 4

At the fourth step, we assess your residual functional capacity (RFC) to determine if you are still able to perform work you have done in the past. Your RFC is your ability to do physical and mental work activities on a sustained basis despite limitations from your impairments. Your RFC is assessed using all the relevant evidence in the record. If you can still do your past relevant work you are not disabled under these standards.

Claimant reports past relevant work in construction as an electrical contractor; as a self-employed pet store owner; in manufacturing doing furniture assembly; and in sales as a wholesale furniture representative.

At this hearing Claimant specifically asserted he cannot work because of back pain, foot pain, shortness of breath, social anxiety, poor memory and loss of concentration.

Your residual functional capacity is your remaining physical, mental, and other abilities. Those abilities are outlined in 20 CFR 416.945.

Physical abilities. When we assess your physical abilities, we first assess the nature and extent of your physical limitations and then determine your residual functional capacity for work activity on a regular and continuing basis. A limited ability to perform certain physical demands of work activity, such as sitting, standing, walking, lifting, carrying, pushing, pulling, or other physical functions (including manipulative or postural functions, such as reaching, handling, stooping or crouching), may reduce your ability to do past work and other work.

Mental abilities. When we assess your mental abilities, we first assess the nature and extent of your mental limitations and restrictions and then determine your residual functional capacity for work activity on a regular and continuing basis. A limited ability to carry out certain mental activities, such as limitations in understanding, remembering, and carrying out instructions, and in responding appropriately to supervision, coworkers, and work pressures in a work setting, may reduce your ability to do past work and other work.

Other abilities affected by impairment(s). Some medically determinable impairment(s), such as skin impairment(s), epilepsy, impairment(s) of vision, hearing or other senses, and impairment(s) which impose environmental restrictions, may cause limitations and restrictions which affect other work-related abilities. If you have this type of impairment(s), we consider any resulting limitations and restrictions which may reduce your ability to do past work and other work in deciding your residual functional capacity.

Classifications of work based on physical exertion requirements are defined in 20 CFR 416.967.

(a) *Sedentary work.* Sedentary work involves lifting no more than 10 pounds at a time and occasionally lifting or carrying articles like docket files, ledgers, and small tools. Although a sedentary job is defined as one which involves sitting, a certain amount of walking and standing is often necessary in carrying out job duties. Jobs are sedentary if walking and standing are required occasionally and other sedentary criteria are met.

(b) *Light work.* Light work involves lifting no more than 20 pounds at a time with frequent lifting or carrying of objects weighing up to 10 pounds. Even though the weight lifted may be very little, a job is in this category when it requires a good deal of walking or standing, or when it involves sitting most of the time with some pushing and pulling of arm or leg controls. To be considered capable of performing a full or wide range of light work, you must have the ability to do substantially all of these activities. If someone can do light work, we determine that he or she can also do sedentary work, unless there are additional limiting factors such as loss of fine dexterity or inability to sit for long periods of time.

(c) *Medium work.* Medium work involves lifting no more than 50 pounds at a time with frequent lifting or carrying of objects weighing up to 25 pounds. If someone can do medium work, we determine that he or she can also do sedentary and light work.

(d) *Heavy work.* Heavy work involves lifting no more than 100 pounds at a time with frequent lifting or carrying of objects weighing up to 50 pounds. If someone can do heavy work, we determine that he or she can also do medium, light, and sedentary work.

20 CFR 416.929 says that statements about your pain or other symptoms will not alone establish that you are disabled, there must be medical signs and laboratory findings which show that you have a medical impairment(s) which could reasonably be expected to produce the pain or other symptoms alleged.

Review of the objective medical evidence in the record shows that Claimant has mental impairments that reduce his ability to perform more complex work tasks. Claimant also has physical impairments which reduce his ability to do some work tasks. However, Claimant still has residual functional capacity to perform a wide range of simple, unskilled, light work. Claimant's light past relevant work involved more complex mental work capacity. The rest of his past relevant work was more physically strenuous than light work. Claimant is not able to perform any of his past relevant work.

STEP 5

At the fifth step your residual functional capacity (RFC) is considered along with your age, education, and work experience to see if you can make an adjustment to other work you have not previously done. If you have a combination of sufficient remaining abilities and transferable skills to adjust to other work, you are not disabled. If it is determined that you cannot make an adjustment to other work, we will find that you are disabled.

Age is one of the aspects of your vocational profile considered in this step. The following age categories are established in 20 CFR 416.963 for use in the Social Security Administration Medical-Vocational Guidelines.

A younger person is under age 50. If you are a younger person we generally do not consider that your age will seriously affect your ability to adjust to other work. However, in some circumstances, we consider that persons age 45-49 are more limited in their ability to adjust to other work than persons who have not attained age 45.

A person closely approaching advanced age is 50-54 years old. If you are closely approaching advanced age, we will consider that your age along with a severe impairment(s) and limited work experience may seriously affect your ability to adjust to other work.

A person of advanced age is over 55. We consider that at advanced age, age significantly affects a person's ability to adjust to other work. We have special rules for persons of advanced age and for persons in this category who are closely approaching retirement age (age 60-64).

Education is another aspects of your vocational profile considered in this step. The following categories of education are established in 20 CFR 416.964 for use in the Social Security Administration Medical-Vocational Guidelines.

(1) *Illiteracy*. Illiteracy means the inability to read or write. We consider someone illiterate if the person cannot read or write a simple message such as instructions or inventory lists even though the person can sign his or her name. Generally, an illiterate person has had little or no formal schooling.

(2) *Marginal education*. Marginal education means ability in reasoning, arithmetic, and language skills which are needed to do simple, unskilled types of jobs. We generally consider that formal schooling at a 6th grade level or less is a marginal education.

(3) *Limited education*. Limited education means ability in reasoning, arithmetic, and language skills, but not enough to allow a person with these educational qualifications to do most of the more complex job duties needed in semi-skilled or skilled jobs. We generally consider that a 7th grade through the 11th grade level of formal education is a limited education.

(4) *High school education and above*. High school education and above means abilities in reasoning, arithmetic, and language skills acquired through formal schooling at a 12th grade level or above. We generally consider that someone with these educational abilities can do semi-skilled through skilled work.

(5) *Inability to communicate in English*. Since the ability to speak, read and understand English is generally learned or increased at school, we may consider this an educational factor. Because English is the dominant language of the country, it may be difficult for someone who doesn't speak and understand English to do a job, regardless of the amount of education the

person may have in another language. Therefore, we consider a person's ability to communicate in English when we evaluate what work, if any, he or she can do. It generally doesn't matter what other language a person may be fluent in.

Work skills are another aspects of your vocational profile considered in this step. The following categories of work skills are established in 20 CFR 416.968 for use in the Social Security Administration Medical-Vocational Guidelines.

In order to evaluate your skills and to help determine the existence in the national economy of work you are able to do, occupations are classified as unskilled, semi-skilled, and skilled. In classifying these occupations, we use materials published by the Department of Labor. When we make disability determinations under this subpart, we use the following definitions:

(a) *Unskilled work.* Unskilled work is work which needs little or no judgment to do simple duties that can be learned on the job in a short period of time. The job may or may not require considerable strength. For example, we consider jobs unskilled if the primary work duties are handling, feeding and offbearing (that is, placing or removing materials from machines which are automatic or operated by others), or machine tending, and a person can usually learn to do the job in 30 days, and little specific vocational preparation and judgment are needed. A person does not gain work skills by doing unskilled jobs.

(b) *Semi-skilled work.* Semi-skilled work is work which needs some skills but does not require doing the more complex work duties. Semi-skilled jobs may require alertness and close attention to watching machine processes; or inspecting, testing or otherwise looking for irregularities; or tending or guarding equipment, property, materials, or persons against loss, damage or injury; or other types of activities which are similarly less complex than skilled work, but more complex than unskilled work. A job may be classified as semi-skilled where coordination and dexterity are necessary, as when hands or feet must be moved quickly to do repetitive tasks.

(c) *Skilled work.* Skilled work requires qualifications in which a person uses judgment to determine the machine and manual operations to be performed in order to obtain the proper form, quality, or quantity of material to be produced. Skilled work may require laying out work, estimating quality, determining the suitability and needed quantities of materials, making precise measurements, reading blueprints or other specifications, or making necessary computations or mechanical adjustments to control or regulate the work. Other skilled jobs may require dealing with people, facts, or figures or abstract ideas at a high level of complexity.

The Social Security Administration Medical-Vocational Guidelines are divided into categories based on the maximum sustained work capability a person still has.

Claimant is a closely approaching advanced age and has more than a high school education. He has a history of semi-skilled/skilled work and the RFC to do simple unskilled light work. In accordance with Medical-Vocational Guidelines Rule 202.13 Claimant is not disabled.

DECISION AND ORDER

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the above findings of fact and conclusions of law, decides the Department of Human Services properly determined that Claimant is not disabled and denied Claimant's September 19, 2012 application for Medical Assistance (MA) based on disability and State Disability Assistance (SDA).

It is ORDERED that the actions of the Department of Human Services, in this matter, are **UPHELD**.

/s/

Gary F. Heisler
Administrative Law Judge
for Maura D. Corrigan, Director
Department of Human Services

Date Signed: 12/27/2013

Date Mailed: 12/27/2013

NOTICE OF APPEAL: The claimant may appeal the Decision and Order to Circuit Court within 30 days of the receipt of the Decision and Order or, if a timely Request for Rehearing or Reconsideration was made, within 30 days of the receipt date of the Decision and Order of Reconsideration or Rehearing Decision.

Michigan Administrative Hearing System (MAHS) may order a rehearing or reconsideration on either its own motion or at the request of a party within 30 days of the mailing date of this Decision and Order. MAHS will not order a rehearing or reconsideration on the Department's motion where the final decision cannot be implemented within 90 days of the filing of the original request (60 days for FAP cases).

A Request for Rehearing or Reconsideration may be granted when one of the following exists:

- Newly discovered evidence that existed at the time of the original hearing that could affect the outcome of the original hearing decision;
- Misapplication of manual policy or law in the hearing decision which led to a wrong conclusion;
- Typographical, mathematical or other obvious error in the hearing decision that affects the rights of the client;
- Failure of the ALJ to address in the hearing decision relevant issues raised in the hearing request.

201360568/GFH

The Department, AHR or the claimant must specify all reasons for the request. MAHS will not review any response to a request for rehearing/reconsideration. A request must be *received* in MAHS within 30 days of the date the hearing decision is mailed.

The written request must be faxed to (517) 335-6088 and be labeled as follows:

Attention: MAHS Rehearing/Reconsideration Request

If submitted by mail, the written request must be addressed as follows:

Michigan Administrative Hearings
Reconsideration/Rehearing Request
P.O. Box 30639
Lansing, Michigan 48909-07322

GFH/ sw

cc:

