STATE OF MICHIGAN MICHIGAN ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING SYSTEM ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES

IN THE MATTER OF:



Reg. No.: Issue No.: Case No.: Hearing Date: County:

2013-60603 2009; 4031

November 20, 2013 Genesee

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE: Vicki L. Armstrong

HEARING DECISION

Following Claimant's r equest for a hearing, this matter is before the undersigned Administrative Law J udge pursuant to MCL 400.9 and 400.37; 42 CFR 431.200 t o 431.250; and 45 CF R 205.10. After due notice, a telephon e hearing was held on November 20, 2013, from Lansing, Mich igan. Claimant per sonally appeared and testified. Participant s on behal f of the Department i ncluded Eligibility Specialist

ISSUE

Whether the Department of Human Serv ices (the department) properly denied Claimant's application for Medical Assistan ce (MA), retroactive Medical Assistance (Retro-MA) and State Disability Assistance (SDA)?

FINDINGS OF FACT

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the competent, material and substantial evidence on the whole record, finds as material fact:

- (1) On July 1, 2012, Clai mant filed an applic ation for MA/Retro-MA and SDA benefits alleging disability.
- (2) On June 13, 2013, the Medical Re view Team (MRT) denied Claimant's application for MA-P/Retro-MA indi cating Claimant was c apable of performing other work. SDA for lack of duration. (Dept Ex. A, pp 46-47).
- (3) On June 17, 2013, the department case worker sent Claimant notice that her application was denied.
- (4) On July 19, 2013, Claimant filed a request for a hearing to contest the department's negative action.

- (5) On September 23, 2013, the Stat e Hearing Review Team (SHRT) found Claimant was not disable ed indicating she was capable of performing a wide range of simple, unskilled work. (Depart Ex. B, pp 1-2).
- (6) Claimant has a history of alopecia, bone cyst, arth ritis, bipolar disorder, manic depression, schizoaffective disorder, panic dis order wit h agoraphobia, posttraumatic stress di sorder, sciatica, gastroesophageal reflux disease and endometriosis.
- (7) On May 22, 2012, Claimant's treating psychiatrist at completed a Mental Residual Functional Capacity Assessment. According to Claimant's Mental Residual F unctional Capacity Assessment, she was markedly limited in her ability to understand and remember one or twostep instructions: understand and rememb er detailed instructions; carry out detailed instructions; maintain attention and concentr ation for extended periods; perform ac tivities within a schedule, maintain regular attendance, and to be punctual within customary tolerances; sustain an ordinary routine without supervision; work in coordination with or proximity to others without being di stracted by them; make simple work-related decisions, complete a normal workday and worksheet without interruptions from psychologically based symptoms and to perform at a consistent pace without an unreasonable nu mber and length of rest periods; interact appropriately with the general public , ask simple guestions or request assistance, accept instructions and respond appropriately to criticism from supervisors: respond appropriately to change in the work setting: travel in unfamiliar places or u se public transportation and to s et realistic goals or make plans independently of others. The psychiatrist added that Claimant has major difficulties functioning in public places due to high anxiety. She reports having major problems completing daily task s due to her mental health decisions. She would experience severe panic in a work setting. (Depart Ex. A, pp 7-8).
- (8) On October 31, 2012, Claimant under went a psychological ev aluation on behalf of the Department. Claimant's demonstrated affect was depressed and anxious with brief tearfu lness at times. She re lated in a cooperative fashion with no oppositionality or limit testing, but she was easily confused on the sensorium and mental capacity portion of the evaluation. The evaluation results are considered a r easonably accurate reflection of her current functioning. She complained of hearing music and talking to herself. Diagnosis: Axis I: Bipolar disorder with depr ession and anxiety; Axis II: None; Axis III: Back pain and sciatic a; Axis IV: 4; Axis V: GAF=47. The examining psychologist opined that Claimant continue to be involved in outpatient psychiatric treatment designed to reduce ps vchiatric symptoms and to stabilize her daily functioning. The ongoing use of psychotropic medication will be an essential component of this treatment.

Such treatment will be a neces sary adjunct to any s uccessful long-term attempt at vocational rehabilitation. (Depart Ex. A, pp 51-53).

- (9) On Januar y 29, 2013, Claimant under went a psyc hiatric examination. Claimant has a history of depression for many years. She is nerv ous and afraid. She has panic attacks and fear of leaving her house. Diagnosis: Axis I: Schizoaffective; Panic di sorder with agoraphobia ; Alcohol abuse ; Posttraumatic stress disorder; Axis II: Borderline personality disorder; Axis III: Chronic pain; GERD; bone cyst; alopecia; endom etriosis; back pain; sciatica; Axis IV: Problem with prim ary supports, education, occ upational, housing, economic access to healthcare and psychological problems; Axis V: GAF=50. (Depart Ex. A, pp 57-59).
- (10) Claimant is a 40 y ear old woman whos e birthday is Claimant is 5'5" tall a nd weighs 110 lbs. Cla imant completed the eighth grade through special education classes.
- (11) Claimant had applied for Social Security disability benefits at the time of the hearing.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Medic al Assistance (MA) program is est ablished by the Title XIX of the Socia I Security Act and is implemented by Title 42 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR). The Department of Human Services (formerly known as the Family Independ ence Agency) administers the MA program pursuant to MCL 400.10, *et seq .*, and MC L 400.105. Department polic ies are found in the Bri dges Administrative Manual (BAM), the Bridges Eligibility Manual (BEM) and the Reference Tables Manual (RFT).

The State Disability A ssistance (SDA) program which provides financial assistance for disabled persons is established by 2004 PA 344. The Department of Human Service s (DHS or department) admin isters the SDA program pursuant to MCL 400.10, *et seq.*, and Mich Admin Code, Rules 400.3151-400.3180. Department policies are found in the Bridges Administrative Manual (BAM), th *e* Bridges Eligibilit y Manual (BEM) and the Reference Tables Manual (RFT).

Current legislative amendments to the Act delineate eligibility criteria as implemented by department policy set forth in program manuals. 2004 PA 344, Se c. 604, es tablishes the State Disability Assistance program. It reads in part:

Sec. 604 (1). The department sha II operate a state di sability assistance program. Except as provided in subsection (3), persons eligible for this program shall includ e needy citizens of the United States or aliens exempt from the Supplemental Security Income citizenship re quirement who are at least 18 years of age or emanc ipated minors meeting one or more of the following requirements:

(b) A per son with a physical or mental impairment whic h meets federal SSI disab ility standards, exce pt that the minimum duration of the dis ability shall be 90 days. Substance abuse alone is not defined as a basis for eligibility.

Specifically, this Act provides minimal cash assistance to individuals with some type of severe, temporary disability which prevents him or her from engaging in substantial gainful work activity for at least ninety (90) days.

The person claiming a physica I or mental disability has the burden to establish it through the use of competent medical evidence from qualified medical sources such as his or her medical history, clinical/laboratory findings, di agnosis/prescribed treatment, prognosis for recovery and/or medical assessment of ability to do work-related activities or ability to reason and to make appropriate mental adjustments, if a mental disability is being alleged, 20 CF R 416.913. An individual's subjective pain complaints are not, in and of the mselves, sufficient to establish disability. 20 CF R 416.908 a nd 20 CF R 416.929. By the same token, a conclus ory statement by a physici an or mental health professional that an individual is disabled or blind is not suffi cient without supporting medical evidence to establish disability. 20 CFR 416.929.

A set order is used to deter mine disability . Current work activity, severity of impairments, residual functional capacity, past wor k, age, or education and work experience is reviewed. If there is a finding that an individual is disabled or not disabled at any point in the review, there will be no further evaluation. 20 CFR 416.920.

If an individual is working and the work is substantial gainful activity, the individual is not disabled regardless of the medic al condition, education and work experienc e. 20 CFR 416.920(c). If the impairment, or combination of impairments, do not significantly limit physical or mental ability to do basic work activities, it is not a severe impairment(s) and disability does not e xist. Age, education a nd work e xperience will not be c onsidered. 20 CFR 416.920.

Statements about pain or other symptoms do not alone establish disability. There must be medical signs and laborator y findings which demons trate a medical impairment. 20 CFR 416.929(a).

Medical reports should include -

- (1) Medical history.
- (2) Clinical findings (suc h as the results of physical or mental status examinations);

- (3) Laboratory findings (such as blood pressure, X-rays);
- (4) Diagnosis (statement of dis ease or injury based on its signs and symptoms). 20 CFR 416.913(b).

In determining disability under the law, the ability to work is measured. An individual's functional capacity for doing bas ic work activities is evaluated. If an individual has the ability to perform basic work activities with out significant limitations, he or she is not considered disabled. 20 CFR 416.994(b)(1)(iv). Basic work activities are the abilities and aptitudes necessary to do most jobs. Examples of these include –

- (1) Physical functions such as walking, standing, sitting, lifting, pushing, pulling, reaching, carrying, or handling;
- (2) Capacities for seeing, hearing, and speaking;
- (3) Understanding, carrying out, and remembering simple instructions;
- (4) Use of judgment;
- (5) Responding appropriately to supervision, co-workers and usual work situations; and
- (6) Dealing with changes in a routine work setting. 20 CFR 416.921(b).

Medical findings must allow a determination of (1) the nature and limiting effects of your impairment(s) for any period in question; (2) the probable duration of the impairment; and (3) the residual functional capacity to do work-related physical and mental activities. 20 CF R 416.913(d). The residual functional capacity is what an individu al can do despite limitations. All impa irments will be considered in addition to abilit y to meet certain demands of jobs in the national ec onomy. Physical demands, mental demands, sensory requirements and other functions will be evaluated. 20 CFR 416.945(a).

To determine the physical demands (exertional requirements) of work in the national economy, we class ify jobs as sedentary, lig ht, medium and heavy. These terms have the same meaning as they have in the *Dictionary of Occupational Titles*, published by the Department of Labor. 20 CFR 416.967. Sedentary work involves lifting no more than 10 pounds at a time and occasionally lifting or carrying articles like docket files, ledgers, and small tools. Although a sedentary job is def ined as one which involves sitting, a certain amount of wa Iking and standing is often necess ary in carrying out job duties. Jobs are sedentary if walking and standing are required occasionally and other sedentary criteria are met. 20 CFR 416.967(a). Light work involves lifting no more than 20 pounds at a time with frequent lifting or carrying of objects weighing up to 10 pounds. Even though the weight lifted may be very little, a job is in this category when it requires

a good deal of walk ing or standing, or when it involves sitting most of the time with some pushing and pulling of arm or leg c ontrols. 20 CFR 416.967(b). Medium work involves lift ing no more t han 50 pounds at a time wit h frequent lifting or carrying of objects weighing up to 25 pounds. If someone can do medium work, we det ermine that he or she can also do sedentar y and light work. 20 CFR 416. 967(c). Heavy work involves lifting no more than 100 pounds at a time with frequent lifting or carrying o f objects weighing up to 50 pounds . If some one can do heavy work, we deter mine that he or she can also do medium, light, and sedentary work. 20 CFR 416.967(d).

The Administrative Law Judge is responsible for making the determination or decis ion about whether the statutory definition of disability is met. The Administrative Law Judge reviews all medical findings and other ev idence that support a medical source's statement of disability. 20 CFR 416.927(e).

When determining disability, the federal regulations require that several considerations be analyzed in sequential order. If disability can be ruled out at any step, analysis of the next step is <u>not</u> required. These steps are:

- 1. Does the client perf orm Substantial Gainful Activit y (SGA)? If yes, the client is ineligible for MA. If no, the analysis continues to Step 2. 20 CFR 416.920(b).
- Does the client have a severe impairment that has lasted or is expected to last 12 months or more or result in death? If no, the cli ent is ineligible for MA. If yes, the analys is c ontinues t o Step 3. 20 CF R 416.920(c).
- 3. Does the impairment appear on a special listing of impairments or are the cli ent's symptoms, signs, and laboratory findings at least equi valent in severity to the set of medical findings specified for the listed impairment? If no, the analysis continues to Step 4. If yes, MA is approved. 20 CFR 416.290(d).
- Can the client do the former work that he/she performed within the last 15 year s? If yes, the client is ineligible for MA. If no, the analysis continues to Step 5. 20 CFR 416.920(e).
- Does the client have the Residual Functional Capacity (RFC) to perform other work according to t he guidelines set forth at 20 CFR 404, Subpart P, Appendix 2, Sections 200.00-204.00? If yes, the analysis ends and the client is ineligible for MA. If no, MA is approved. 20 CFR 416.920(f).

Based on Finding of Fact #6-#10 above this Administrative Law Judge answers:

Step 1: No.

Step 2: Yes.

Step 3: Yes. Claimant has show n, by clear and convincing documentary evidenc e and credib le testimony, her mental impairments meet or equal Listing 12.04(A) and 12.04(B):

12.04 *Affective disorders*: Characterized by a distur bance of mood, accompanied by a full or partial manic or depressive syndrome. Mood refe rs to a prolonged emotion that colors the whole psychic li fe; it generally involves either depression or elation.

The required level of severity for these disorders is met when the requirements in both A and B are satisfied, or when the requirements in C are satisfied.

A. Medically documented persist ence, either continuous or intermittent, of one of the following:

1. Depressive syndrome characterized by at least four of the following:

a. Anhedonia or per vasive los s of intere st in a lmost all activities; or

- b. Appetite disturbance with change in weight; or
- c. Sleep disturbance; or
- d. Psychomotor agitation or retardation; or

e. Decreased energy; or

f. Feelings of guilt or worthlessness; or

- g. Difficulty concentrating or thinking; or
- h. Thoughts of suicide; or
- i. Hallucinations, delusions, or paranoid thinking; or

2. Manic s yndrome characterized by at least three of the following:

- a. Hyperactivity; or
- b. Pressure of speech; or

- c. Flight of ideas; or
- d. Inflated self-esteem; or
- e. Decreased need for sleep; or
- f. Easy distractibility; or

g. Involvement in activities that have a high probability of painful consequences which are not recognized; or

h. Hallucinations, delusions or paranoid thinking; or

3. Bipolar syndrome with a hi story of episodic periods manifested by the full symptomatic picture of both manic and depressive syndromes (and currently characterized by either or both syndromes);

AND

- B. Resulting in at least two of the following:
- 1. Marked restriction of activities of daily living; or
- 2. Marked difficulties in maintaining social functioning; or

3. Marked difficulties in maintaining concentration, persistence, or pace; or

4. Repeated episodes of decomp ensation, each of extended duration;

The objective medic al records show Claim ant has a pervasiv e loss of interest in activities, sleep disturbance without medication, feelings of worthlessness, difficulty thinking, difficulty concentrating, paranoid the inking and hallucinations in addition to marked difficulties in maintaining social functioning and maintaining concentration, persistence and pace. Accordingly, this Administrative Law J udge concludes that Claimant is disabled for purposes of the MA/Retro-MA and SDA programs. Consequently, the department 's denial of her July 1, 2012, MA/Retro-MA and SDA application cannot be upheld.

DECISION AND ORDER

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon t he above findings of fact and conclusion s of law, decides the department erred in determining Claimant is not currently disabled for MA/Retro-MA and SDA eligibility purposes.

Accordingly, the department's decision is **REVERSED**, and it is ORDERED that:

- 1. The department shall pr ocess Claimant's July 1, 2012, MA/Retro-MA and SDA application, and shall award her all the benefit s she may be entitled to receive, as long as she meets t he remaining financial and non-financial eligibility factors.
- 2. The department shall rev iew Claimant's medica I cond ition for improvement in November, 2014, unless her Social Security Administration disability status is approved by that time.
- 3. The department shall obtain updated medical evidence from Claimant's treating physicians, physical therapists, pain clinic notes, etc. regarding her continued treatment, progress and prognosis at review.

It is SO ORDERED.

Dichi Z. C

Vicki L. Armstrong Administrative Law Judge for Maura D. Corrigan, Director Department of Human Services

Date Signed: November 22, 2013

Date Mailed: November 22, 2013

NOTICE OF APPE AL: The Claimant may appeal the De cision and Order to Circuit Court within 30 days of the receipt of the Decision and Order or, i f a timely Request for Rehearing or Reconsiderati on was made, within 30 days of the receipt date of the Decision and Order of Reconsideration or Rehearing Decision.

Michigan Administrative Hearing Syst em (MAHS) may order a rehearing or reconsideration on either its own motion or at the request of a par ty within 30 days of the mailing date of this Dec ision and Order . MAHS will not or der a rehearing or reconsideration on the Department's mo tion where the final decis ion cannot be implemented within 90 days of the filing of the original request (60 days for FAP cases).

A Request for Rehearing or Reconsideration may be granted when one of the following exists:

• Newly disc overed evidence that existed at the time of the or iginal hearing that could affect the outcome of the original hearing decision;

- Misapplication of manual policy or law in the hearing decision which led to a wrong conclusion;
- Typographical, mathematical or other obvious error in the hearing decision that affects the rights of the client;
- Failure of the ALJ to address in the hearing decision relevant issues raised in the hearing request.

The Department, AHR or the clai mant must specify all reas ons for the request. MAHS will not review any response to a request for rehearing/reconsideration. A request must be *received* in MAHS within 30 days of the date the hearing decision is mailed.

The written request must be faxed to (517) 335-6088 and be labeled as follows:

Attention: MAHS Rehearing/Reconsideration Request

If submitted by mail, the written request must be addressed as follows:

Michigan Administrative Hearings Reconsideration/Rehearing Request P.O. Box 30639 Lansing, Michigan 48909-07322

VLA/las

