

**STATE OF MICHIGAN  
MICHIGAN ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING SYSTEM  
ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS FOR THE  
DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES**

**IN THE MATTER OF:**

[REDACTED]

Reg. No: 2012-50019  
Issue No: 1038  
Case No: [REDACTED]  
Hearing Date: June 7, 2012  
County: Kalamazoo

**ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE:** C. Adam Purnell

**HEARING DECISION**

This matter is before the undersigned Administrative Law Judge pursuant to MCL 400.9 and MCL 400.37 upon Claimant's request for a hearing received on April 27, 2012. After due notice, a telephone hearing was held on June 7, 2012. Claimant personally appeared and provided testimony. Participants on behalf of Department of Human Services (Department) included [REDACTED] (Triage Specialist) and [REDACTED] (JET/Michigan Works).

**ISSUE**

Whether the Department properly terminated and sanctioned Claimant's Family Independence Program (FIP) benefits for noncompliance with Work First/Jobs, Education and Training (WF/JET) requirements?

**FINDINGS OF FACT**

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the competent, material and substantial evidence on the whole record, finds as material fact:

1. Claimant and her boyfriend/group member [REDACTED] applied for FIP benefits on May 24, 2011.
2. Both Claimant and Mr. Ellard were mandatory WF/JET participants.
3. On December 27, 2011, Mr. Ellard, as part of their required participation in the WF/JET program, agreed to complete 40 (forty) hours of participation each week in a combination of part-time employment, job search, community service, work experience, secondary education, vocational training, GED and workshops. Specifically, [REDACTED] was required to complete 27 (twenty-seven) hours per week of job search 16 (sixteen) hours per week of community service.

4. [REDACTED] was also required to submit verifications of job search and community service hours to the WF/JET/Michigan Works office.
5. During the week of February 14, 2012, [REDACTED] failed to return any verification regarding his community service hours.
6. [REDACTED] did not provide any verification of community service hours for the week of February 21, 2012.
7. [REDACTED] also failed to complete the required 16 community service hours per week during the entire month of March, 2012.
8. On April 4, 2012, the Department mailed [REDACTED] a Notice of Noncompliance (DHS-2444) because he failed to participate as required in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities. [REDACTED] Triage appointment was scheduled for April 17, 2012 at 1:00p.m. The deadline for [REDACTED] to show good cause was April 16, 2012. The notice indicated that failure to show good cause could result in loss of benefits.
9. On April 16, 2012, [REDACTED] attended the triage and stated that he had medical problems. [REDACTED] did not provide any evidence of medical problems that affected his ability to comply with the JET requirements. Following the Triage, the Department found that [REDACTED] did not show good cause for his noncompliance.
10. The Department mailed Claimant a Notice of Case Action (DHS-1605) on April 17, 2012, closing Claimant's FIP benefits for a lifetime effective May 1, 2012, due to [REDACTED] failure to participate in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities.
11. Claimant submitted a hearing request on April 27, 2012, protesting the closure of her FIP benefits.
12. This is Claimant's third non-compliance with the WF/JET program.

### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

The regulations governing the hearing and appeal process for applicants and recipients of public assistance in Michigan are found in the Michigan Administrative Code, MAC R 400.901-400.951. An opportunity for a hearing shall be granted to an applicant who requests a hearing because his claim for assistance is denied. MAC R 400.903(1). Clients have the right to contest a department decision affecting eligibility or benefit levels whenever it is believed that the decision is incorrect. The department will provide an administrative hearing to review the decision and determine the appropriateness. BAM 600.

The Family Independence Program (FIP) was established pursuant to the Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996, Public Law 104-193, 8 USC 601, et seq. The Department of Human Services (DHS or Department) administers the FIP program pursuant to MCL 400.10, et seq., and MAC R 400.3101-3131. The FIP program replaced the Aid to Dependent Children (ADC) program effective October 1, 1996. Department policies are found in the Bridges Administrative Manual (BAM), the Bridges Eligibility Manual (BEM), Reference Table Manual (RFT), and the Bridges Reference Manual (BRM).

Department policy states that clients must be made aware that public assistance is limited to 48 months to meet their family's needs and that they must take personal responsibility to achieve self-sufficiency. BEM 229. This message, along with information on ways to achieve independence, direct support services, non-compliance penalties, and good cause reasons, is initially shared by the department when the client applies for cash assistance. BEM 229. The Jobs, Education and Training (JET) program requirements, education and training opportunities, and assessments are covered by the JET case manager when a mandatory JET participant is referred at application for FIP, when a client's reason for deferral ends, or a member add is requested. BEM 229.

Federal and State laws require each work eligible individual (WEI) in the FIP and Refugee Assistance Program (RAP) group to participate in the Jobs, Education and Training (JET) Program or other employment-related activities unless temporarily deferred or engaged in activities that meet participation requirements. These clients must participate in employment and/or self-sufficiency-related activities to increase their employability and obtain stable employment. WEIs not referred to the work participation program will participate in other activities to overcome barriers so they may eventually be referred to the work participation program or other employment service provider. BEM 230A.

At application, the Department is required to use the Bridges DHS-1538, Work and Self-Sufficiency Rules, to explain all of the following to clients at FIP application for each episode of assistance: (1) direct support services opportunities, including transportation and child care required to attend orientation; (2) work requirements and reasons why a person may be deferred from the work participation program and work requirements; (3) self-sufficiency requirements; (4) penalties for non-compliance, the triage and hearing processes and good cause; (5) earnings or activity reporting and verification requirements, including the semi-annual reporting requirement for families with earnings; (6) domestic violence; (7) FIP is limited to a 48 month lifetime limit per individual (See BEM 234, FIP Time Limit); and (8) prohibited use of FIP for gambling, massage parlors, spas, tattoo shops, bail-bond agencies, adult entertainment, cruise ships, other nonessential items or to purchase lottery tickets, alcohol, or tobacco. BEM 229.

At application, the Department is required to ensure the client understands his/her responsibility to participate in employment-related activities including, but not limited to,

calling before they are unable to attend a meeting or appointment and before they become noncompliant. The Department shall also coordinate with the client an agreed upon date for attendance at orientation. This will eliminate the need for multiple assignment dates or appointment changes. BEM 229.

The DHS-1538 must be reviewed and signed by all of the following applicants and member adds: (1) adult members; (2) minor parent grantees; (3) deferred and potentially deferred adults; and (4) ineligible grantees. BEM 229. Policy requires the Department file the original signed copy of the DHS-1538, Work and Self-Sufficiency Rules, in the case record and give a photocopy to the client at the in-person interview or mail the client a copy following a phone interview. BEM 229.

When assigned, clients must engage in and comply with all work participation program assignments while the FIP application is pending. Work participation program engagement is a condition of FIP eligibility. Failure by a client to participate fully in assigned activities while the FIP application is pending will result in denial of FIP benefits. Bridges automatically denies FIP benefits for noncompliance while the application is pending. BME 229.

The work participation program is administered by the Workforce Development Agency, State of Michigan (WDASOM) through the Michigan one-stop service centers. The work participation program serves employers and job seekers for employers to have skilled workers and job seekers to obtain jobs that provide economic self-sufficiency. BEM 230A. A WEI who refuses, without good cause, to participate in assigned employment and/or other self-sufficiency related activities is subject to penalties. BEM 230A.

**An 18 year old adult group member is considered a WEI and must attend the work participation program, regardless of school attendance. BEM 230A.** Certain clients have particular circumstances which may make their participation in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities problematic. Unless otherwise deferred, they must be referred to the work participation program. BEM 230A.

A person with short-term incapacity may be deferred for up to 3 (three) months. BEM 230A. A person with a short-term incapacity is a person with a mental or physical illness, limitation, or incapacity expected to last less than 3 (three) months which prevents participation. BEM 230A. The Department will verify the short-term incapacity and the length of the incapacity using a DHS-54A, Medical Needs, or DHS-54E, Medical Needs - Work Participation Program, or other written statement from an M.D./D.O. BEM 230A. Then, the Department shall set the medical review date accordingly, but not to exceed three months. BEM 230A. BEM 230A. specifically prohibits the Department from advising with a short-term incapacity to apply for SSI. BEM 230A.

A person with long-term incapacity, or disability, may be deferred. BEM 230A. At intake, redetermination or anytime during an ongoing benefit period, when an individual claims to be disabled or indicates an inability to participate in work or the work participation program for more than 90 days because of a mental or physical condition,

the client should be deferred. BEM 230A. Conditions include medical problems such as mental or physical injury, illness, impairment or learning disabilities. BEM 230A. This may include those who have applied for RSDI/SSI. BEM 230A.

When the Medical Review Team (MRT) decision and information is received, the Department must determine what accommodations the client needs to participate in the work participation program. BEM 230A. The person must pursue employment and/or self sufficiency-related activities and the Department must follow the procedure for accommodating disabilities. BEM 230A.

The Department must serve individuals who are determined work ready or work ready with limitations by the Medical Review Team when the individual cannot be served by the work participation program. BEM 230A. These clients have a mandatory participation status in Bridges. BEM 230A. The Department must assign self-sufficiency activities up to the medically permissible limit of the individual. BEM 230A. The Department should ask the work participation program to provide any test results or other documentation about the client's limitations at the time the client is referred back to DHS. BEM 230A.

When a client is determined by MRT to be work ready with limitations becomes noncompliant with the work participation program or his/her assigned activities, the Department shall follow the same instructions outlined in BEM 233A with regard to noncompliance.

An applicant, recipient or a member add is noncompliant if he or she, without good cause, fails or refuses to do any of the following: (1) appear and participate with the Jobs, Education and Training (JET) Program or other employment service provider; (2) complete a Family Automated Screening Tool (FAST), as assigned as the first step in the Family Self-Sufficiency Plan (FSSP) process; (3) develop a FSSP or a Personal Responsibility Plan and Family Contract (PRPFC); (4) comply with activities assigned to on the FSSP; (5) provide legitimate documentation of work participation; (6) appear for a scheduled appointment or meeting related to assigned activities; (7) participate in employment and/or self-sufficiency-related activities; (8) accept a job referral; (9) complete a job application; (10) appear for a job interview.<sup>1</sup> BEM 233A.

**Noncompliance by a WEI while the application is pending results in group ineligibility.** A WEI applicant who refused employment without good cause, within 30 days prior to the date of application or while the application is pending, must have benefits delayed. BEM 233A. If a WEI applicant refuses suitable employment without good cause while the FIP application is pending (or up to 30 days before the FIP application date), approve FIP benefits no earlier than the pay period following the pay

---

<sup>1</sup> The Department will not apply the three month, six month or lifetime penalty to ineligible caretakers, clients deferred for lack of child care and disqualified aliens. Failure to complete a FAST or FSSP results in closure due to failure to provide requested verification. Clients can reapply at any time. BEM 233A.

period containing the 30th day after the refusal of employment. A non-WEI who does not complete the FAST within 30 days and the application is still pending is denied FIP. A good cause determination is not required for applicants who are noncompliant prior to FIP case opening. If a WEI member add refuses suitable employment without good cause while the FIP member add is pending, close the FIP EDG for the minimum number of penalty months. BEM 233A.

Noncompliance also can be found if an applicant, recipient or a member add, without good cause, does any of the following: (1) states orally or in writing a definite intent not to comply with program requirements; (2) threatens, physically abuses or otherwise behaves disruptively toward anyone conducting or participating in an employment and/or self-sufficiency-related activity; or (3) refuses employment support services if the refusal prevents participation in an employment and/or self-sufficiency-related activity. BEM 233A.

JET participants will not be terminated from a JET program without first scheduling a "triage" meeting with the client to jointly discuss noncompliance and good cause. BEM 233A. The department coordinates the process to notify the MWA case manager of triage meetings including scheduling guidelines. BEM 233A.

Clients can either attend a meeting or participate in a conference call if attendance at the triage meeting is not possible. BEM 233A. If a client calls to reschedule an already scheduled triage meeting, the client is offered a telephone conference at that time. BEM 233A. Clients must comply with triage requirement within the negative action period. BEM 233A.

The department is required to send a DHS-2444, Notice of Employment and/or Self-Sufficiency Related Noncompliance within three days after learning of the noncompliance which must include the date of noncompliance, the reason the client was determined to be noncompliant, the penalty that will be imposed and the triage date within the negative action period. BEM 233A.

Good cause is a valid reason for noncompliance with employment and/or self-sufficiency-related activities that are based on factors that are beyond the control of the noncompliant person. A claim of good cause must be verified and documented for member adds and recipients. If it is determined at triage that the client has good cause, and good cause issues have been resolved, the client should be sent back to JET. BEM 233A. Good cause should be determined based on the best information available during the triage and prior to the negative action date. Good cause may be verified by information already on file with DHS or MWA. Good cause must be considered even if the client does not attend, with particular attention to possible disabilities (including disabilities that have not been diagnosed or identified by the client) and unmet needs for accommodation. BEM 233A.

The penalty for noncompliance without good cause is FIP closure. BEM 233A. Effective October 1, 2011, the following minimum penalties apply: (1) for the individual's first

occurrence of noncompliance, FIP closure is for not less than three calendar months; (2) for the individual's second occurrence of noncompliance, FIP closure is for not less than six calendar months; (3) for the individual's third occurrence of noncompliance, FIP closure is a lifetime sanction. BEM 233A. The individual penalty counter begins April 1, 2007. Individual penalties served after October 1, 2011 will be added to the individual's existing penalty count. BEM 233A.

Depending on the case situation, penalties include the following: (1) delay in eligibility at application; (2) ineligibility (denial or termination of FIP with no minimum penalty period); (3) case closure for a minimum of three months for the first episode of noncompliance, six months for the second episode of noncompliance and lifetime closure for the third episode of noncompliance. BEM 233A.

The sanction period begins with the first pay period of a month. BEM 233A. Penalties are automatically calculated by the entry of noncompliance without good cause in the Department's computer system known as Bridges. This applies to active FIP cases, including those with a member add who is a WEI work participation program participant. BEM 233A.

The individual penalty counter begins April 1, 2007. Individual penalties served after October 1, 2011 will be added to the individual's existing penalty count. BEM 233A. The sanction period begins with the first pay period of a month. Penalties are automatically calculated by the entry of noncompliance without good cause in Bridges. This applies to active FIP cases, including those with a member add who is a WEI work participation program participant. BEM 233A. Bridges applies noncooperation penalties at an individual level. BEM 233A. Two parent families will have two individual penalty counters. The FIP EDG penalty is applied based on the individual with the highest penalty counter. BEM 233A. In a two parent family, one parent has to reach his/her individual penalty count of three for the case to close for a lifetime sanction. BEM 233A.

In this matter, the Department has shown that [REDACTED] was noncompliant with JET and that he did not have good cause for his failure to turn in his community service documents. Claimant did not dispute the Department's allegations nor did she provide any substantive response to the Department.

Accordingly, this Administrative Law Judge finds that, based on the material and substantial evidence presented during the hearing, [REDACTED] (Claimant's group member) has failed to show good cause for failing to complete his community service activity reports. As a result, the Department properly closed Claimant's FIP case for non-compliance.

### **DECISION AND ORDER**

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the above findings of fact and conclusions of law, decides that the Department properly closed Claimant's FIP case for noncompliance with WF/JET requirements and the lifetime sanction is AFFIRMED.

It is SO ORDERED.

/s/

\_\_\_\_\_  
C. Adam Purnell  
Administrative Law Judge  
for Maura D. Corrigan, Director  
Department of Human Services

Date Signed: 6/19/12

Date Mailed: 6/19/12

**NOTICE:** Michigan Administrative Hearing System (MAHS) may order a rehearing or reconsideration on either its own motion or at the request of a party within 30 days of the mailing date of this Decision and Order. MAHS will not order a rehearing or reconsideration on the Department's motion where the final decision cannot be implemented within 90 days of the filing of the original request.

The Claimant may appeal the Decision and Order to Circuit Court within 30 days of the mailing of the Decision and Order or, if a timely request for rehearing was made, within 30 days of the receipt date of the rehearing decision.

Claimant may request a rehearing or reconsideration for the following reasons:

- A rehearing **MAY** be granted if there is newly discovered evidence that could affect the outcome of the original hearing decision.
- A reconsideration **MAY** be granted for any of the following reasons:
- misapplication of manual policy or law in the hearing decision,
- typographical errors, mathematical error, or other obvious errors in the hearing decision that effect the substantial rights of the claimant;
- the failure of the ALJ to address other relevant issues in the hearing decision

Request must be submitted through the local DHS office or directly to MAHS by mail at  
Michigan Administrative Hearings  
Reconsideration/Rehearing Request  
P.O. Box 30639  
Lansing, Michigan 48909-07322

CAP/ds

■ [REDACTED]