

**STATE OF MICHIGAN
STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS AND RULES
FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY HEALTH**

P.O. Box 30763, Lansing, MI 48909
(877) 833-0870; Fax: (517) 334-9505

IN THE MATTER OF:

██████████

Appellant

_____ /

Docket No. 2011-11442 QHP
Case No. 35704642

DECISION AND ORDER

This matter is before the undersigned Administrative Law Judge pursuant to MCL 400.9 and 42 CFR 431.200 *et seq.*, upon the Appellant's request for a hearing.

After due notice, a hearing was held on ██████████. ██████████, Appellant's ██████████ appeared on behalf of the Appellant.

██████████, represented the Medicaid Health Plan (MHP). ██████████, appeared as a witness for the MHP.

ISSUE

Did the Medicaid Health Plan properly deny Appellant's request for speech therapy?

FINDINGS OF FACT

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the competent, material and substantial evidence on the whole record, finds as material fact:

1. Appellant is ██████████ and Medicaid beneficiary.
2. Appellant's representative at hearing is Appellant's ██████████.
3. Appellant lives with his ██████████.
4. The Appellant attends the ██████████ program in the ██████████ School District. (Testimony of Appellant's ██████████).
5. The ██████████ School District is responsible for providing speech therapy to Appellant.

██████████
Docket No. 2011-11442 QHP
Decision and Order

6. On ██████████ the Appellant received a speech language pathology evaluation at the ██████████. (Exhibit 1, Pages 10-15).
7. The Appellant has a working diagnosis of "severe apraxia of speech characterized by significant difficulties coordinating oral motor movements and patterns for speech production." (Exhibit 1, Page 10).
8. The evaluation recommended individual speech language therapy. Evaluation also recommended the Appellant's ██████████ pursue therapy through the head start program and for home school district. (Exhibit 1, Page 11).
9. The Appellant's ██████████ requested speech therapy from the ██████████ School District but Appellant's school put him on the "long waiting list." (Testimony of Appellant's ██████████).
10. On or around ██████████, the ██████████ sent a request to the MHP for speech therapy to be provided through the MHP. (Exhibit 1, Pages 9-15).
11. On ██████████, the MHP sent a letter to the Appellant denying authorization for speech therapy. The reason given was "speech therapy to treat the ways in speech development (progress) is not covered. This service may be provided to another public agency via the ██████████ School District (example: Early On or Project Find)." (Exhibit 1, Pages 2-3).
12. On ██████████, the Department received Appellant's Request for Hearing. (Exhibit 2).

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Medical Assistance Program is established pursuant to Title XIX of the Social Security Act and is implemented by Title 42 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR). It is administered in accordance with state statute, the Social Welfare Act, the Administrative Code, and the State Plan under Title XIX of the Social Security Act Medical Assistance Program.

On May 30, 1997, the Michigan Department of Community Health (Department or MDCH) received approval from the Health Care Financing Administration, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, allowing Michigan to restrict Medicaid beneficiaries' choice to obtain medical services only from specified Medicaid Health Plans.

The Respondent is one of those Medicaid Health Plans. As such, the MHP contracts with the Department to provide medically necessary Medicaid covered services to eligible Medicaid beneficiaries:

The covered services that the Contractor has available for enrollees must include, at a minimum, the covered services listed below (List omitted by Administrative Law Judge). The Contractor may limit services to those which are medically necessary and appropriate, and which conform to professionally accepted standards of care. The Contractor must operate consistent with all applicable Medicaid provider manuals and publications for coverages and limitations. If new services are added to the Michigan Medicaid Program, or if services are expanded, eliminated, or otherwise changed, the Contractor must implement the changes consistent with State direction in accordance with the provisions of Contract Section 2.024.

*Section 1.022(E)(1), Covered Services.
MDCH contract (Contract) with the Medicaid Health Plans,
October 1, 2009.*

(1) The major components of the Contractor's utilization management (UM) program must encompass, at a minimum, the following:

- Written policies with review decision criteria and procedures that conform to managed health care industry standards and processes.
- A formal utilization review committee directed by the Contractor's medical director to oversee the utilization review process.
- Sufficient resources to regularly review the effectiveness of the utilization review process and to make changes to the process as needed.
- An annual review and reporting of utilization review activities and outcomes/interventions from the review.
- The Um activities of the Contractor must be integrated with the Contractor's QAPI program.

(2) Prior Approval Policy and Procedure

The Contractor must establish and use a written prior approval policy and procedure for UM purposes. The Contractor may not use such policies and procedures to avoid providing medically necessary services within the coverages established under the Contract. The policy must ensure that the review criteria for authorization decisions are applied consistently and require that the reviewer consult with the requesting provider when appropriate. The policy must also require that UM

decisions be made by a health care professional who has appropriate clinical expertise regarding the service under review.

*Section 1.022(AA), Utilization Management, Contract,
October 1, 2009.*

The Michigan Medicaid program covers speech therapy if specified criteria are met. As stated in the Department-MHP contract language above, a MHP “must operate consistent with all applicable Medicaid provider manuals and publications for coverages and limitations.”

The MHP Medical Director, ██████████ testified that its policies regarding limitations on speech therapy were consistent with Medicaid policy. It is noted that the MHP policy used for the MHP denial is consistent with the Department policy for the MHP. (Exhibit one, page 6).

The pertinent sections of the Michigan Medicaid Provider Manual (MPM) are as follows:

5.3 SPEECH THERAPY

The terms speech therapy, speech-language pathology, speech-language therapy, and therapy are used to mean speech and language rehabilitation services and speech-language therapy.

MDCH covers speech-language therapy provided in the outpatient setting. MDCH only reimburses services for speech-language therapy when provided by:

- A speech-language pathologist (SLP) with a current Certificate of Clinical Competence (CCC).
- An appropriately supervised SLP candidate (i.e., in their clinical fellowship year [CFY]) or having completed all requirements but has not obtained a CCC. All documentation must be reviewed and signed by the appropriately credentialed supervising SLP.
- A student completing his clinical affiliation under direct supervision of (i.e., in the presence of) an SLP having a current CCC. All documentation must be reviewed and signed by the appropriately credentialed supervising SLP.

MDCH expects that all SLPs will utilize the most ethically appropriate therapy within their scope of practice as defined by Michigan law and/or the appropriate national professional association.

For all beneficiaries of all ages, speech therapy must relate to a medical diagnosis, and is limited to services for:

- Articulation
- Language
- Rhythm
- Swallowing
- Training in the use of a speech-generating device
- Training in the use of an oral-pharyngeal prosthesis
- Voice

For CSHCS beneficiaries (i.e., those not enrolled in Medicaid; only enrolled with CSHCS), therapy must be directly related to the CSHCS-eligible diagnosis(es) and prescribed by the specialty physician who is overseeing the care of the beneficiary.

Therapy must be reasonable, medically necessary and expected to result in an improvement and/or elimination of the stated problem within a reasonable amount of time (i.e., when treatment is due to a recent change in medical or functional status affecting speech, and the beneficiary would experience a reduction in medical or functional status without therapy).

Speech therapy services must be skilled (i.e., require the skills, knowledge and education of a certified SLP to assess the beneficiary for deficits, develop a treatment program and provide therapy).

Interventions that could be provided by another practitioner (e.g., teacher, registered nurse [RN], licensed physical therapist [LPT], registered occupational therapist [OTR], family member, or caregiver) would not be reimbursed as speech therapy by MDCH.

For beneficiaries of all ages, therapy is **not** covered:

- When provided by an independent SLP.
- For educational, vocational, social/emotional, or recreational purposes.
- If services are required to be provided by another public agency (e.g., PIHP/CMHSP provider, SBS).
- When intended to improve communication skills beyond premorbid levels (e.g., beyond the functional communication status prior to the onset of a new diagnosis or change in medical status).
- If it requires PA but is rendered before PA is approved.

- If it is habilitative. Habilitative treatment includes teaching someone communication skills for the first time without compensatory techniques or processes. This may include syntax or semantics (which are developmental) or articulation errors that are within the normal developmental process.
- If it is designed to facilitate the normal progression of development without compensatory techniques or processes.
- If continuation is maintenance in nature.
- If provided to meet developmental milestones.
- If Medicare does not consider the service medically necessary. (Underline emphasis added).

Michigan Medicaid Provider Manual Outpatient Therapy,
October 1, 2010, pages 19-20.

The MHP witness testified that its policy does not cover speech therapy if it is provided to meet developmental milestones. The MHP medical director witness explained that the Appellant's diagnosis of apraxia combined with his speech performance profile indicated his speech condition was due to a developmental delay instead of due to an injury, or birth defect affecting the throat, mouth, or hearing. The MHP witness elaborated that because in Appellant's case speech therapy was recommended for his developmental delay, it was not a covered service under Medicaid and, likewise, not a covered service by the MHP.

The Appellant's ██████████ testified that she requested a hearing after the Medicaid health plan's denial because the Appellant is not able to communicate with her. The Appellant's ██████████ explained that the Appellant cannot say his name, the letters of the alphabet, or numbers.

The Medicaid health plan medical director testified that speech therapy is not a covered service for school-age children because Medicaid gives money to the schools for school-based speech therapy, and the intermediate school district should be providing speech therapy. The Appellant's ██████████ responded that she has requested speech therapy from the Appellant's school, and she provided the ██████████ ██████████ speech and language evaluation to the school, but the school placed the Appellant on "a long waiting list" for speech therapy.

The Michigan Medicaid Provider Manual addresses the school system's obligation to provide speech therapy as follows:

5.3.A. DUPLICATION OF SERVICES

Some areas (e.g., dysphagia, assistive technology) may appropriately be addressed by more than one discipline (e.g., OT, PT, speech therapy) in more than one setting. MDCH does not cover duplication of services, i.e., where two

disciplines are working on similar areas/goals. It is the treating therapist's responsibility to communicate with other practitioners, coordinate services, and document this in his reports.

5.3.B. SERVICES TO SCHOOL-AGED BENEFICIARIES

School-aged beneficiaries may be eligible to receive speech-language therapy through multiple sources. Educational speech is expected to be provided by the school system and is not covered by MDCH or CSHCS. Examples of educational speech include enhancing vocabulary, improving sentence structure, improving reading, increasing attention span, and identifying colors and numbers. Only medically necessary therapy may be provided in the outpatient setting. Coordination between all speech therapy providers should be continuous to ensure a smooth transition between sources.

Outpatient therapy provided to school-aged children during the summer months in order to maintain the therapy services provided in the school are considered a continuation of therapy services when there is no change in beneficiary diagnosis or function. Prior authorization is required before initiating a continuation of therapy.


Michigan Medicaid Provider Manual Outpatient Therapy,
October 1, 2010, page 20.

The MHPs first reason for denial, that it does not cover speech therapy for developmental delay is consistent with Medicaid policy. The MHPs second reason for denial, that the Appellant's speech therapy is a school-based service and as such should be provided by his school district, is consistent with Medicaid policy. Even giving great consideration to the concerns of Appellant's ██████████, the MHP cannot be ordered to provide speech therapy in this circumstance because the MHP is prohibited from using Medicaid funds to cover speech therapy if it is the school's obligation to cover speech therapy for the Appellant.

The Appellant failed to prove by a preponderance of evidence that the MHP was obligated to provide speech therapy and the MHP properly denied speech therapy services at this time.

DECISION AND ORDER

The Administrative Law Judge, based on the above findings of fact and conclusions of law, decides that the Medicaid Health Plan properly denied Appellant's request for speech therapy.


Docket No. 2011-11442 QHP
Decision and Order

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that:

The Medicaid Health Plan's decision is **AFFIRMED**.

Lisa K. Gigliotti
Administrative Law Judge
for Olga Dazzo, Director
Michigan Department of Community Health

cc: 

Date Mailed: 2/24/2011

***** NOTICE *****

The State Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules may order a rehearing on either its own motion or at the request of a party within 30 days of the mailing date of this Decision and Order. The State Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules will not order a rehearing on the Department's motion where the final decision or rehearing cannot be implemented within 90 days of the filing of the original request. The Appellant may appeal the Decision and Order to Circuit Court within 30 days of the receipt of the Decision and Order or, if a timely request for rehearing was made, within 30 days of the receipt of the rehearing decision.