STATE OF MICHIGAN STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS AND RULES ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES

IN THE MATTER OF:



Reg. No: 2010-55064 Issue No: 1038, 3029

Hearing Date: October 21, 2010

Washtenaw County DHS

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE: Gary F. Heisler

HEARING DECISION

This matter is before the undersigned Administrative Law Judge pursuant to MCL 400.9; and MCL 400.37 upon claimant's request for a hearing. After due notice, a hearing was held on October 21, 2010. Claimant and appeared and testified.

<u>ISSUES</u>

Did the Department of Human Services properly sanction Claimant's Family Independence Program (FIP) case for failure to participate in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities?

Did the Department of Human Services properly sanction Claimant's Food Assistance Program (FAP) case for failure to participate in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities?

FINDINGS OF FACT

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the competent, material and substantial evidence on the whole record, finds as material fact:

(1) Claimant was an ongoing recipient of Family Independence Program (FIP), Food Assistance Program (FAP) and Child Development and Care (CDC) benefits. Claimant's benefit group consists of herself Mr. Clark and four children two of which are under the age of 6. Claimant and Mr. Clark were mandatory participants in the Michigan Works Agency/Jobs Education and Training Program (JET).

- (2) On June 14, 2010, JET worker recorded that Claimant has submitted her orientation timesheet for the week. The note also states that Claimant missed Thursday but was instructed to make it up the next week.
- (3) On June 22, 2010, JET worker recorded that Claimant has submitted her orientation timesheet for the week. The note also states that Claimant did not complete the workshops for Wednesday and did not complete 3 outside applications for Thursday.
- (4) On June 30, 2010, Claimant and participated in the triage meeting. Case notes show that DHS worker and JET worker conducted the meeting. The Department determined there was no good cause for Claimant's failure to participate in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities.
- (5) On July 2, 2010, Claimant submitted a request for hearing.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Family Independence Program (FIP) was established pursuant to the Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996, Public Law 104-193, 8 USC 601, et seq. The Department of Human Services (formerly known as the Family Independence Agency) administers the FIP program pursuant to MCL 400.10, et seq., and MAC R 400.3101-3131. The FIP program replaced the Aid to Dependent Children (ADC) program effective October 1, 1996. Department policies are found in the Bridges Administrative Manual (BAM), the Bridges Eligibility Manual (BEM) and the Program Reference Manual (PRM).

The Food Assistance Program (FAP) (formerly known as the Food Stamp (FS) program) is established by the Food Stamp Act of 1977, as amended, and is implemented by the federal regulations contained in Title 7 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR). The Department of Human Services (DHS or department) administers the FAP program pursuant to MCL 400.10, et seq., and MAC R 400.3001-3015. Department policies are found in the Bridges Administrative Manual (BAM), the Bridges Eligibility Manual (BEM) and the Program Reference Manual (PRM).

Department policy provides the following guidance for case workers. The Department's policies are available on the internet through the Department's website.

BEM 233A FAILURE TO MEET EMPLOYMENT AND/OR SELFSUFFICIENCY-RELATED REQUIREMENTS: FIP

DEPARTMENT PHILOSOPHY

FIP

DHS requires clients to participate in employment and selfsufficiency related activities and to accept employment when offered. Our focus is to assist clients in removing barriers so they can participate in activities which lead to selfsufficiency. However, there are consequences for a client who refuses to participate, without good cause.

The goal of the FIP penalty policy is to obtain client compliance with appropriate work and/or self-sufficiency related assignments and to ensure that barriers to such compliance have been identified and removed. The goal is to bring the client into compliance.

Noncompliance may be an indicator of possible disabilities. Consider further exploration of any barriers.

DEPARTMENT POLICY

FIP

All Work Eligible Individual (WEI) and adult non-WEIs (except ineligible grantees, clients deferred for lack of child care (DC) and disqualified aliens), see BEM 228, who fail, without good cause, to participate in employment or self-sufficiency-related activities, must be penalized.

Depending on the case situation, penalties include the following:

- Delay in eligibility at application.
- Ineligibility (denial or termination of FIP with no minimum penalty period).
- Case closure for a minimum of three or 12 months.

See BEM 233B for the Food Assistance Program (FAP) policy when the FIP penalty is closure. For the Refugee Assistance Program (RAP) penalty policy, see BEM 233C.

NONCOMPLIANCE WITH EMPLOYMENT AND/OR SELF-SUFFICIENCY RELATED ACTIVITIES

As a condition of eligibility, all WEIs and non-WEIs must work or engage in employment and/or self-sufficiency-related activities. **Noncompliance** of applicants, recipients, or member adds means doing **any** of the following **without** good cause:

Exception: Do not apply the three or 12 month penalty to ineligible caretakers, clients deferred for lack of child care (DC) and disqualified aliens. Failure to complete a FAST or FSSP results in closure due to failure to provide requested verification. Clients can reapply at any time.

- Failing or refusing to:
 - Appear and participate with the Jobs, Education and Training (JET) Program or other employment service provider.
 - Complete a Family Automated Screening Tool (FAST), as assigned as the first step in the FSSP process.

Note: FIS should clear the FAST Fall Out Report and any FAST confirmation information the client has obtained before considering a client noncompliant for FAST non-completion.

 Develop a Family Self-Sufficiency Plan (FSSP) or a Personal Responsibility Plan and Family Contract (PRPFC).

Note: FIS must have scheduled a FSSP completion appointment with the client and the client failed to attend before considering a client noncompliant for FSSP noncompletion.

- Comply with activities assigned to on the Family Self Sufficiency Plan (FSSP) or PRPFC.
- Provide legitimate documentation of work participation.

- Appear for a scheduled appointment or meeting.
- Participate in employment and/or selfsufficiency-related activities.
- Accept a job referral.
- Complete a job application.
- Appear for a job interview (see the exception below).
- Stating orally or in writing a definite intent not to comply with program requirements.
- Threatening, physically abusing or otherwise behaving disruptively toward anyone conducting or participating in an employment and/ or selfsufficiency-related activity.
- Refusing employment support services if the refusal prevents participation in an employment and/or selfsufficiency-related activity.

GOOD CAUSE FOR NONCOMPLIANCE

Good cause is a valid reason for noncompliance with employment and/ or self-sufficiency-related activities that are based on factors that are beyond the control of the noncompliant person. A claim of good cause must be verified and documented for member adds and recipients.

NONCOMPLIANCE PENALTIES FOR ACTIVE FIP CASES AND MEMBER ADDS

The penalty for noncompliance without good cause is FIP closure.

Effective April 1, 2007, the following minimum penalties apply:

 For the first occurrence on the FIP case, close the FIP for 3 calendar months unless the client is excused from the noncompliance as noted in "First Case Noncompliance Without Loss of Benefits" below.

- For the second occurrence on the FIP case, close the FIP for 3 calendar months.
- For the third and subsequent occurrence on the FIP case, close the FIP for 12 calendar months.

The penalty counter also begins April 1, 2007 regardless of the previous number of noncompliance penalties.

Begin the sanction period with the first pay period of a month. Penalties are automatically calculated by the entry of noncompliance without good cause on the FSSP. This applies to active FIP cases, including those with a member add who is a WEI JET participant.

TRIAGE

JET participants will not be terminated from a JET program without first scheduling a "triage" meeting with the client to jointly discuss noncompliance and good cause. Locally coordinate a process to notify the MWA case manager of triage meetings including scheduling guidelines.

Clients can either attend a meeting or participate in a conference call if attendance at the triage meeting is not possible. If a client calls to reschedule an already scheduled triage meeting, offer a phone conference at that time. Clients must comply with triage requirements within the negative action period.

When a phone triage is conducted for a first noncompliance and the client agrees to comply, complete the DHS-754, First Noncompliance Letter, as you would complete in a triage meeting. Note in the client signature box "Client Agreed by Phone". Immediately send a copy of the DHS-754 to the client and phone the JET case manager if the compliance activity is to attend JET.

Determine good cause based on the best information available during the triage and prior to the negative action date. Good cause may be verified by information already on file with DHS or MWA.

BEM 233B FAILURE TO MEET EMPLOYMENT REQUIREMENTS: FAP

DEPARTMENT PHILOSOPHY

DHS requires participation in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities associated with the Family Independence Program (FIP) or Refugee Assistance Program (RAP). Applicants or recipients of Food Assistance Program (FAP) only must accept and maintain employment. There are consequences for client, who refuse to participate in FIP/RAP employment and/or self-sufficiency-related activities or refuses to accept or maintain employment without good cause.

DEPARTMENT POLICY

The policies in this item apply to all FAP applicants and recipients age 16 and over. Noncompliance, without good cause, with employment requirements for FIP/RAP (see BEM 233A) may affect FAP if **both** programs were active on the date of the FIP noncompliance.

Michigan's FAP Employment and Training program is voluntary and penalties for noncompliance may only apply in the following two situations:

- Client is active FIP/RAP and FAP and becomes noncompliant with a cash program requirement without good cause.
- Client is pending or active FAP only and refuses employment (voluntarily quits a job, is fired or voluntarily reduces hours of employment) without good cause.

At no other time is a client considered noncompliant with employment or self-sufficiency related requirements for FAP.

PROCESS FOR FIP/RAP ASSOCIATED NONCOMPLIANCE

When you learn that a client is noncompliant do the following:

- Send the DHS-2444, Notice of Employment and/or Self-Sufficiency Related Noncompliance within three days of the noncompliance. Check all programs that apply to the noncompliance (FIP/RAP and/or RAP) and the related penalty count that applies to each as outlined on the form.
- Hold the triage appointment/phone conference and document the results in Bridges.

Note: If the client does not participate in the triage meeting, determine good cause for FAP based on information known at the time of the determination.

 Determine FAP good cause separately from the FIP/RAP based on FAP good cause reasons defined later in this item. If a good cause reason is selected for FIP/RAP it also applies to FAP. If the client does not meet one of the FIP/RAP good cause reasons in the drop down list, but does meet one of the FAP only good cause reasons, select the FAP only good cause reason to avoid client disqualification on FAP. Bridges makes both determinations simultaneously.

When To Disqualify

Disqualify a FAP group member for noncompliance when all the following exist:

- The client was active both FIP and FAP on the date of the FIP noncompliance, and
- The client did **not** comply with FIP/RAP employment requirements, **and**
- The client is subject to a penalty on the FIP/RAP program, and
- The client is **not** deferred from FAP work requirements (see DEFERRALS in BEM 230B), and
- The client did not have good cause for the noncompliance.

PEM 230B EMPLOYMENT-RELATED ACTIVITIES: FAP

DEPARTMENT PHILOSOPHY

Department of Human Services (DHS) has a unique opportunity to assist families in becoming strong, viable, participative members of the community. By involving the adult members of the household in employment-related activities, we help restore self-confidence and a sense of self-worth. These are cornerstones to building strong, self-reliant families.

The goal of the Food Assistance Program is to ensure sound nutrition among children and adults. In addition, the goal of our employment-related policies for FAP households is to assist applicants and recipients toward self-sufficiency by providing them with opportunities to pursue employment and/or education and training.

DEPARTMENT POLICY

Use this item to determine work-related activities and deferrals for FAP clients. Also use this item when FIP or RAP closes for any reason other than a penalty or disqualification. The items listed below must be used when FIP or RAP closes due to noncompliance and a penalty or disqualification is imposed.

If the noncompliant client:

- Received FIP and FAP on the date of noncompliance, see BEM 233B.
- Received RAP and FAP on the date of noncompliance, see BEM 233C.
- Did not receive FIP or RAP on the date of noncompliance, see BEM 233B.

DEFERRALS

Clients meeting one of the criteria below are temporarily deferred from employment-related activities.

Age

Defer a person who is:

- Under age 16 or at least age 60; or
- A16- or 17-year old who is **not** the grantee; **or**
- A grantee age 16 or 17 who
 - •• Lives with a parent or person in that role, **or**
 - Attends school at least half time, or
 - •• Is enrolled in an employment/training program at least **half time**.

Care of a Child

Defer one person who personally provides care for a child under age 6 who is in the FAP group.

Care of Disabled Household Member

Defer one person who personally provides care for a disabled member of his/her own FAP group.

Disability

Defer persons incapacitated due to injury, physical illness or mental illness.

Education

A student enrolled at least **half time** in any recognized school, training program or institution of higher education meets the employment related activities requirement. This includes persons attending school for GED or adult high school completion.

Pregnancy

Defer pregnant women, beginning the **seventh** month of pregnancy **or** earlier if a pregnancy complication is medically documented.

Confirmation by an MD, DO, certified nurse-midwife, ob-gyn nurse practitioner or ob-gyn clinical nurse specialist which **must** include an expected date of delivery.

SSI/FAP Applicants

Defer applicants who apply for **both** SSI and FAP through the Social Security Administration. The application for SSI and FAP must be made at the same time.

Substance Abuse Treatment Center Participant

Defer active participants in inpatient or outpatient programs for substance abuse treatment and rehabilitation. This does not include AA or NA group meetings.

Unemployment Compensation (UC) Applicant or Recipient

Defer an applicant for or recipient of unemployment compensation (UC). This includes a person whose UC application denial is being appealed.

In this case the only Department representative was a DHS case worker who was not present at the triage meeting. No evidence was submitted by the Department establishing the exact participation requirements for Claimant and or evidence was submitted by the Department establishing Claimant's participation activities for the week in which she is alleged to have been non-compliant. Claimant testified that they missed the Wednesday workshop because their car and broke down when they were out doing job search activity. They testified that their JET case manager, , told them missing the Wednesday workshop was OK because they had done job search activity. They also testified that on Thursday they were making up the workshop they had missed the Thursday before and did not understand that they also had to do all the applications for that day on top of making up the workshop. Case notes written by and submitted by the Department about the triage meeting, indicate that no good cause was found because it was explained in orientation that if authorized to do make up the regular assigned activity must also be done along with the make up activity. There is no evidence in the record showing that conducted orientation for Claimant.

The Department has an initial burden to go forward and show that their proposed action is in accordance with policy and law. In this case the Department has not submitted sufficient evidence to meet that initial burden.

DECISION AND ORDER

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the above findings of fact and conclusions of law, decides the Department of Human Services DID NOT properly sanction Claimant's Family Independence Program (FIP) and Food Assistance Program (FAP) cases for failure to participate in employment and/or self-sufficiency related activities.

It is ORDERED that the actions of the Department of Human Services, in this matter, are REVERSED.

It is further ORDERED that the Department of Human Services reinstate Claimant's Family Independence Program (FIP) and Food Assistance Program (FAP) cases and issue any benefits she did not receive as a result of this incorrect, proposed action.

____/s/___
Gary F. Heisler
Administrative Law Judge
for Ismael Ahmed, Director
Department of Human Services

Date Signed: 10/26/2010

Date Mailed: 10/26/2010

NOTICE: Administrative Hearings may order a rehearing or reconsideration on either its own motion or at the request of a party within 30 days of the mailing date of this Decision and Order. Administrative Hearings will not order a rehearing or reconsideration on the Department's motion where the final decision cannot be implemented within 60 days of the filing of the original request.

The Claimant may appeal the Decision and Order to Circuit Court within 30 days of the receipt of the Decision and Order or, if a timely request for rehearing was made, within 30 days of the receipt date of the rehearing decision.

