

**STATE OF MICHIGAN**  
**STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS AND RULES**  
**FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY HEALTH**  
P.O. Box 30763, Lansing, MI 48909  
(877) 833-0870; Fax: (517) 334-9505

IN THE MATTER OF:

██████████,  
Appellant

\_\_\_\_\_ /

Docket No. 2009-28248 QHP  
Case No. ██████████

**DECISION AND ORDER**

This matter is before the undersigned Administrative Law Judge pursuant to MCL 400.9 and 42 CFR 431.200 *et seq.* upon the Appellant's request for a hearing.

After due notice, a hearing was held ██████████. The Appellant was represented by ██████████. The Appellant's ██████████, were present and testified on his behalf.

██████████ for ██████████ represented the Medicaid Health Plan (hereinafter MHP or ██████████). ██████████, was present and testified on behalf of the MHP.

**ISSUE**

Did the Medicaid Health Plan properly deny Appellant's request for speech, physical and occupational therapy?

**FINDINGS OF FACT**

The Administrative Law Judge, based upon the competent, material and substantial evidence on the whole record, finds as material fact:

1. Appellant is a ██████████ and Medicaid beneficiary at the time of his therapy evaluations.
2. The Appellant is diagnosed with myriad of conditions including: Unidentified genetic disorder, hypotonia with severe motor delay, visual impairment, static encephalopathy, global developmental delays and oral motor dyspraxia. (Appellant exhibit A)

3. The Appellant is not meeting his developmental milestones at a typical pace. (uncontested)
4. The Appellant's condition is both acute and chronic. (Appellant exhibit A)
5. The Appellant is not malnourished or undersized. (Appellant's mother's testimony at hearing)
6. The Appellant has participated in speech, occupational and physical therapies. (uncontested)
7. The Appellant has participated in the ██████████ program through his intermediate school district. (uncontested)
8. The Appellant is no longer participating in the ██████████ program offered through his intermediate school district. (uncontested)
9. The Appellant requested additional speech, occupational and physical therapy services be approved and covered by ██████████ in ██████████. (uncontested)
10. On ██████████ and ██████████, the MHP sent the Appellant letters denying authorization for speech, physical and occupational therapy because they are not covered services in the Appellant's circumstance.
11. On ██████████, the Department received Appellant's Request for Hearing.

### **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

The Medical Assistance Program is established pursuant to Title XIX of the Social Security Act and is implemented by Title 42 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR). It is administered in accordance with state statute, the Social Welfare Act, the Administrative Code, and the State Plan under Title XIX of the Social Security Act Medical Assistance Program.

On May 30, 1997, the Michigan Department of Community Health (Department or MDCH) received approval from the Health Care Financing Administration, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, allowing Michigan to restrict Medicaid beneficiaries' choice to obtain medical services only from specified Medicaid Health Plans.

The Respondent is one of those Medicaid Health Plans. As such, the MHP contracts with the Department to provide medically necessary Medicaid covered services to eligible Medicaid beneficiaries:

The covered services that the Contractor has available for enrollees must include, at a minimum, the covered services listed below (List omitted by Administrative Law Judge). The Contractor may limit services to those which are medically necessary and appropriate, and which conform to professionally accepted standards of care.

*Contractors must operate consistent with all applicable Medicaid provider manuals and publications for coverages and limitations. If new services are added to the Michigan Medicaid Program, or if services are expanded, eliminated, or otherwise changed, the Contractor must implement the changes consistent with State direction in accordance with the provisions of Contract Section 1-Z. (Italics added by ALJ).*

*Article II-G, Scope of Comprehensive Benefit Package. MDCH contract (Contract) with the Medicaid Health Plans, September 30, 2004.*

The major components of the Contractor's utilization management plan must encompass, at a minimum, the following:

- Written policies with review decision criteria and procedures that conform to managed health care industry standards and processes.
- A formal utilization review committee directed by the Contractor's medical director to oversee the utilization review process.
- Sufficient resources to regularly review the effectiveness of the utilization review process and to make changes to the process as needed.
- An annual review and reporting of utilization review activities and outcomes/interventions from the review.

The Contractor must establish and use a written prior approval policy and procedure for utilization management purposes. The Contractor may not use such policies and procedures to avoid providing medically necessary services within the coverages established under the Contract. The policy must ensure that the review criteria for authorization decisions are applied consistently and require that the reviewer consult with the requesting provider when appropriate. The policy must also require that utilization management decisions be made by a health care professional who has appropriate clinical expertise regarding the service under review.

*Article II-P, Utilization Management, Contract, September 30, 2004.*

As stated in the Department-MHP contract language above, a MHP, "must operate consistent with all applicable Medicaid Provider Manuals and publications for coverages and limitations." The pertinent sections of the Michigan Medicaid Provider Manual (MPM) are as follows:

### **5.3 SPEECH THERAPY**

The terms speech therapy, speech-language pathology, speech-language therapy, and therapy are used to mean speech and language rehabilitation services and speech-language therapy.

MDCH covers speech-language therapy provided in the outpatient setting. MDCH only reimburses services for speech-language therapy when provided by:

- A speech-language pathologist (SLP) with a current Certificate of Clinical Competence (CCC).
- An appropriately supervised SLP candidate (i.e., in their clinical fellowship year [CFY]) or having completed all requirements but has not obtained a CCC. All documentation must be reviewed and signed by the appropriately credentialed supervising SLP.
- A student completing his clinical affiliation under direct supervision of (i.e., in the presence of) an SLP having a current CCC. All documentation must be reviewed and signed by the appropriately credentialed supervising SLP.

MDCH expects that all SLPs will utilize the most ethically appropriate therapy within their scope of practice as defined by Michigan law and/or the appropriate national professional association.

**For all beneficiaries of all ages**, speech therapy must relate to a medical diagnosis, and is limited to services for:

- Articulation
- Language
- Rhythm
- Swallowing
- Training in the use of a speech-generating device
- Training in the use of an oral-pharyngeal prosthesis
- Voice

**For CSHCS beneficiaries** (i.e., those not enrolled in Medicaid; only enrolled with CSHCS), therapy must be directly related to the CSHCS-eligible diagnosis(es) and prescribed by the specialty physician who is overseeing the care of the beneficiary.

Therapy must be reasonable, medically necessary and expected to result in an improvement and/or elimination of the stated problem within a reasonable amount of time (i.e., when treatment is due to a recent change in medical or functional status affecting speech, and the beneficiary would experience a reduction in medical or functional status without therapy).

Speech therapy services must be skilled (i.e., require the skills, knowledge and education of a certified SLP to assess the beneficiary for deficits, develop a treatment program and provide therapy).

Interventions that could be provided by another practitioner (e.g., teacher, registered nurse [RN], licensed physical therapist [LPT], registered occupational therapist [OTR], family member, or caregiver) would not be reimbursed as speech therapy by MDCH.

For beneficiaries of all ages, therapy is **not** covered:

- When provided by an independent SLP.
- For educational, vocational, social/emotional, or recreational purposes.
- If services are required to be provided by another public agency (e.g., PIHP/CMHSP provider, SBS).
- When intended to improve communication skills beyond premorbid levels (e.g., beyond the functional communication status prior to the onset of a new diagnosis or change in medical status).
- If it requires PA but is rendered before PA is approved.
- If it is habilitative. Habilitative treatment includes teaching someone communication skills for the first time without compensatory techniques or processes. This may include syntax or semantics (which are developmental) or articulation errors that are within the normal developmental process.
- If it is designed to facilitate the normal progression of development without compensatory techniques or processes.
- If continuation is maintenance in nature.
- If provided to meet developmental milestones.
- If Medicare does not consider the service medically necessary.

### **5.3.A. DUPLICATION OF SERVICES**

Some areas (e.g., dysphagia, assistive technology) may appropriately be addressed by more than one discipline (e.g., OT, PT, speech therapy) in more than one setting. MDCH does not cover duplication of services, i.e., where two disciplines are working on similar areas/goals. It is the treating therapist's responsibility to communicate with other practitioners, coordinate services, and document this in his reports.

### **5.3.B. SERVICES TO SCHOOL-AGED BENEFICIARIES**

School-aged beneficiaries may be eligible to receive speech-language therapy through multiple sources. Educational speech is expected to be provided by the school system and is not covered by MDCH or CSHCS. Examples of educational speech include enhancing vocabulary, improving sentence structure, improving reading,

increasing attention span, and identifying colors and numbers. Only medically necessary therapy may be provided in the outpatient setting. Coordination between all speech therapy providers should be continuous to ensure a smooth transition between sources.

Outpatient therapy provided to school-aged children during the summer months in order to maintain the therapy services provided in the school are considered a continuation of therapy services when there is no change in beneficiary diagnosis or function. Prior authorization is required before initiating a continuation of therapy.

Version Outpatient Therapy  
Date: July 1, 2009 Pages 19-20

## **5.2 PHYSICAL THERAPY [CHANGES MADE 4/1/09]**

MDCH uses the terms physical therapy, PT and therapy interchangeably. PT is covered when furnished by a Medicaid-enrolled outpatient therapy provider and performed by a Michigan-licensed Physical Therapist (LPT) or an appropriately supervised Certified Physical Therapy Assistant (CPTA).

The LPT must supervise and monitor the CPTA's performance with continuous assessment of the beneficiary's progress. All documentation must be reviewed and signed by the licensed supervising LPT.

PT must be medically necessary and reasonable for the maximum reduction of physical disability and restoration of a beneficiary to his/her best possible functional level. (revised 4/1/09)

### **For CSHCS beneficiaries**

PT must be directly related to the CSHCS-eligible diagnosis(es) and prescribed by the specialty physician who is overseeing the beneficiary's care. Functional progress must be demonstrated and documented.

### **For beneficiaries 21 years of age and older**

PT is covered if it can be reasonably expected to result in a meaningful improvement in the beneficiary's ability to perform functional day-to-day activities that are significant to the beneficiary's life roles despite impairments, activity limitations or participation restrictions.

MDCH anticipates PT will result in significant functional improvement in the beneficiary's ability to perform mobility skills appropriate to his chronological, developmental, or functional status. These functional

improvements should be able to be achieved in a reasonable amount of time and should be durable (i.e., maintainable). PT making changes in components of function that do not have an impact on the beneficiary's ability to perform age-appropriate tasks is not covered.

PT must be skilled (i.e., require the skills, knowledge and education of a LPT). MDCH does not cover interventions provided by another practitioner (e.g., teacher, RN, OTR, family member, or caregiver).

MDCH covers the physical therapist's initial evaluation of the beneficiary's needs and design of the PT program. The program must be appropriate to the beneficiary's capacity, tolerance, treatment objectives, and include the instructions to the beneficiary and support personnel (e.g., aides or nursing personnel) for delivery of the individualized treatment plan. MDCH covers infrequent reevaluations, if appropriate.

The cost of supplies and equipment used as part of the therapy program is included in the reimbursement for the therapy. MDCH only covers a clinic room charge in addition to PT if it is unrelated.

PT services may be covered for one or more of the following reasons:

- PT is expected to result in the restoration or amelioration of the anatomical or physical basis for the restriction in performing age-appropriate functional mobility skills;
- PT service is diagnostic;
- PT is for a temporary condition that creates decreased mobility and/or function (revised 4/1/09);  
or
- Skilled PT services are designed to set up, train, monitor, and modify a maintenance or prevention program to be performed by family or caregivers. MDCH does not reimburse for routine provision of the maintenance/prevention program.

PT may include:

- Training in functional mobility skills (e.g., ambulation, transfers, and wheelchair mobility);
- Stretching for improved flexibility;
- Instruction of family or caregivers;
- Modalities to allow gains of function, strength, or mobility; and/or
- Training in the use of orthotic/prosthetic devices.

MDCH requires a new prescription if PT is not initiated within 30 days of the prescription date.

PT is not covered for beneficiaries of all ages for the following:

- When PT is provided by an independent LPT. (An independent LPT may enroll in Medicaid if they provide Medicare-covered therapy and intend to bill Medicaid for Medicare coinsurance and/or deductible only.)
- When PT is for educational, vocational, or recreational purposes.
- If PT services are required to be provided by another public agency (e.g., CMHSP services, school-based services [SBS]).
- If PT requires PA and services are rendered prior to approval.
- If PT is habilitative therapy. Habilitative treatment includes teaching a beneficiary how to perform a task (i.e., daily living skill) for the first time without compensatory techniques or processes. For example, teaching a child normal dressing techniques or teaching cooking skills to an adult who has not performed meal preparation tasks previously.
- If PT is designed to facilitate the normal progression of development without compensatory techniques or processes.
- If PT is a continuation of PT that is maintenance in nature.
- If PT services are provided to meet developmental milestones.
- If PT services are not covered by Medicare as medically necessary.

Only medically necessary PT may be provided in the outpatient setting. Coordination between all PT providers must be continuous to ensure a smooth transition between sources.

Version Outpatient Therapy  
Date: July 1, 2009 Pages 13-14

## **SECTION 5 – STANDARDS OF COVERAGE AND SERVICE LIMITATIONS**

### **5.1 OCCUPATIONAL THERAPY**

MDCH uses the terms Occupational Therapy, OT, and therapy interchangeably. OT is covered when furnished by a Medicaid-enrolled outpatient therapy provider when performed by:

- An occupational therapist currently registered in Michigan (OTR);
- A certified occupational therapy assistant (COTA) under the supervision of an OTR (i.e., the COTA's services must follow the evaluation and treatment plan developed by the OTR, and the OTR must supervise and monitor the COTA's performance with continuous assessment of the beneficiary's progress). All documentation must be reviewed and signed by the appropriate supervising OTR; or

- A student completing his clinical affiliation under the direct supervision of (i.e., in the presence of) an OTR. All documentation must be reviewed and signed by the appropriate supervising OTR.

OT is considered an all-inclusive charge and MDCH does not reimburse for a clinic room charge in addition to OT services unless it is unrelated. MDCH expects OTR's and COTA's to utilize the most ethically appropriate therapy within their scope of practice as defined by state law and/or the appropriate national professional association. OT must be medically necessary, reasonable and required to:

- Return the beneficiary to the functional level prior to illness or disability;
- Return the beneficiary to a functional level that is appropriate to a stable medical status; or
- Prevent a reduction in medical or functional status had the therapy not been provided.

**For CSHCS beneficiaries**

OT must be directly related to the CSHCS-eligible diagnosis(es) and prescribed by the specialty physician who is overseeing care.

**For beneficiaries 21 years of age and older**

OT is only covered if it can be reasonably expected to result in a meaningful improvement in the beneficiary's ability to perform functional day-to-day activities that are significant in the beneficiary's life roles despite impairments, activity limitations or participation restrictions.

MDCH anticipates OT will result in a functional improvement that is significant to the beneficiary's ability to perform appropriate daily living tasks (per beneficiary's chronological, developmental, or functional status). Functional improvements must be achieved in a reasonable amount of time and must be maintainable. MDCH does not cover therapy that does not have an impact on the beneficiary's ability to perform age-appropriate tasks.

OT must be skilled (i.e., require the skills, knowledge and education of an OTR). MDCH does not cover interventions provided by another practitioner (e.g., teacher, registered nurse [RN], licensed physical therapist [LPT], family member, or caregiver).

MDCH anticipates OT will result in a functional improvement that is significant to the beneficiary's ability to perform appropriate daily living tasks (per beneficiary's chronological, developmental, or functional status). Functional improvements must be achieved in a reasonable

amount of time and must be maintainable. MDCH does not cover therapy that does not have an impact on the beneficiary's ability to perform age-appropriate tasks.

OT must be skilled (i.e., require the skills, knowledge and education of an OTR). MDCH does not cover interventions provided by another practitioner (e.g., teacher, registered nurse [RN], licensed physical therapist [LPT], family member, or caregiver).

**OT may be covered for one or more of the following:**

- Therapeutic use of occupations\*.
- Adaptation of environments and processes to enhance functional performance in occupations\*.
- Graded tasks (performance components) in activities as prerequisites to an engagement in occupations\*.
- Design, fabrication, application, or training in the use of assistive technology or orthotic devices.
- Skilled services that are designed to set up, train, monitor, and modify a maintenance or prevention program to be carried out by family or caregivers.

Routine provision of the maintenance/prevention program is not a covered OT service.

\* Occupations are goal-directed activities that extend over time (i.e., performed repeatedly), are meaningful to the performer, and involve multiple steps or tasks. For example, doing dishes is a repeated task. Buying dishes happens once; therefore, does not extend over time and is not a repeated task.

**OT is not covered for the following:**

- When provided by an independent OTR\*\*.
- For educational, vocational, or recreational purposes.
- If services are required to be provided by another public agency (e.g., community mental health services provider, school-based services).
- If therapy requires PA and service is rendered before PA is approved.
- If therapy is habilitative. Habilitative treatment includes teaching someone how to perform a task (i.e., daily living skill) for the first time without compensatory techniques or processes. This may include teaching a child normal dressing techniques or cooking skills to an adult who has not performed meal preparation tasks in the past.
- If therapy is designed to facilitate the normal progression of development without compensatory techniques or processes.

- For development of perceptual motor skills and sensory integrative functions to follow a normal sequence. If the beneficiary exhibits severe pathology in the perception of, or response to, sensory input to the extent that it significantly limits the ability to function, OT may be covered.
- Continuation of therapy that is maintenance in nature.

\*\* An independent OTR may enroll in Medicaid if he provides Medicare-covered therapy and intends to bill Medicaid for Medicare coinsurance and/or deductible only.

Version Outpatient Therapy  
Date: July 1, 2009 Page 7

The MHP witness, ██████████, testified he reviewed the requests sent on behalf of the Appellant. He stated the Appellant is suffering developmental delays and the MHP does not cover any of the sought therapies needed to address these. He said coverage for this reason is explicitly excluded, in part because the services are offered through the school systems. He cited the ██████████ program as a source of obtaining the needed therapies for the Appellant.

The Appellant's parents assert the ██████████ program does not address the needs of the Appellant. Specifically, it is not a medical model, rather an educational model. No actual therapy is provided, only training for the parents to participate in a home based program. They discontinued participation in the ██████████ program offered in their intermediate school district due to dissatisfaction with what they are offering. Testimony was presented that when the Appellant had "straight Medicaid" he had all three therapies. Then when he was moved into a Medicaid Health Plan, the therapies were no longer approved. Evidence of the prior authorization for the three therapies was sought by this ALJ and the record left open to allow admission of the documents evidencing this testimony, however, none was received. The record was closed on ██████████. Uncontested testimony was presented evidencing the Appellant has a need for all of the therapies sought. Despite being 2 years old he is unable to stand and walk unassisted, self feed an adequate amount of food, eat regular table food that has not been blended or processed, and speaks only 2 words. The delays are related to multiple medical conditions, including an unidentified genetic disorder, hypotonia with severe motor delay, visual impairment, static encephalopathy and oral motor dyspraxia. There is evidence in the record of feeding difficulties. The Appellant prefers only smooth foods that have been blended or processed to a smooth consistency. He was not chewing or using utensils. There is also evidence of improvement in self feeding activities.

Review of the Medicaid Policy leaves this ALJ in the in-enviable position of finding the MHP has not wrongfully denied the therapies sought. Not because the Appellant is not in need of all three therapies. Certainly not because he is not deserving of them. The Medicaid policy clearly states the therapies are not provided in the specific circumstance the Appellant is in. He is eligible for school based therapy, through ██████████. He is not meeting his developmental milestones. He has not "lost" his abilities and in need of the therapies to help him recover skills he once had; rather, the therapies sought are all habilitative, not rehabilitative. The fact that therapies needed

[REDACTED]  
Docket No. 2009-28248 QHP  
Decision and Order

are habilitative rather than rehabilitative renders the therapies sought specifically excluded from coverage not only for the MHP, but for so called "straight" Medicaid recipients. Beneficiaries in the Appellant's circumstances are expected to obtain the needed therapies through the school based system in place. This ALJ agrees the school based system offers insufficient help for the Appellant. However, this ALJ is powerless to ignore or change policy. Evidence was sought to learn whether therapies could be obtained for the purpose of addressing the feeding and swallowing issues, if any. The evidence is uncontested he is not malnourished or undersized. There is insufficient evidence in the record to find he has a medical need for therapy to address this further at this time.

Medicaid policy is clear that it does not cover speech, physical or occupational therapy for the purpose of meeting developmental milestones. The MHP therapy limitation policy is consistent with the Department's Medicaid policy. This ALJ is left no choice but to uphold the denial of services to the Appellant in this circumstance.

**DECISION AND ORDER**

The Administrative Law Judge, based on the above findings of fact and conclusions of law, finds that the Medicaid Health Plan properly denied Appellant's request for occupational, physical and speech therapy.

**IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED** that:

The Medicaid Health Plan's decision is **AFFIRMED**.

---

Jennifer Isiogu  
Administrative Law Judge  
for Janet Olszewski, Director  
Michigan Department of Community Health

cc:

[REDACTED]

Date Mailed: 9/25/2009

**\*\*\* NOTICE \*\*\***

The State Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules may order a rehearing on either its own motion or at the request of a party within 30 days of the mailing date of this Decision and Order. The State Office of Administrative Hearings and Rules will not order a rehearing on the Department's motion where the final decision or rehearing cannot be implemented within 90 days of the filing of the original request. The Appellant may appeal the Decision and Order to Circuit Court within 30 days of the mailing date of the Decision and Order or, if a timely request for rehearing was made, within 30 days of the mailing date of the rehearing decision.